



Universiteit  
Leiden  
The Netherlands

## **Children and the International Criminal Court : analysis of the Rome Statute through a children's rights perspective**

Chamberlain Bolaños, C.

### **Citation**

Chamberlain Bolaños, C. (2014, March 25). *Children and the International Criminal Court : analysis of the Rome Statute through a children's rights perspective*. Meijers-reeks. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/24891>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/24891>

**Note:** To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/24891> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

**Author:** Chamberlain Bolaños, Cynthia

**Title:** Children and the International Criminal Court : analysis of the Rome Statute through a children's rights perspective

**Issue Date:** 2014-03-25

*Children and the International Criminal Court*



# Children and the International Criminal Court

Analysis of the Rome Statute through a Children's  
Rights Perspective

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van  
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,  
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,  
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties  
te verdedigen op dinsdag 25 maart 2014  
klokke 16.15 uur

*door*

Cynthia Chamberlain Bolaños

geboren te San José, Costa Rica  
in 1977

Promotiecommissie:

Promotoren: prof. dr. mr. M. R. Bruning  
prof. dr. mr. E. van Sliedregt (Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam)

Overige leden: prof. dr. L. J. van den Herik  
prof. dr. W. A. Schabas  
prof. dr. mr. T. Liefwaard  
prof. dr. mr. J. E. Doek, emeritus (Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam)  
judge Silvia A. Fernández de Gurmendi (International Criminal Court, Den Haag)

Lay-out: Anne-Marie Krens – Tekstbeeld – Oegstgeest

ISBN 978 94 6203 519 5

© 2014 C. Chamberlain

*Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.*

*Voorzover het maken van reprografische vervoelvoudingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet 1912 dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, [www.reprorecht.nl](http://www.reprorecht.nl)). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet 1912) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, [www.cedar.nl/pro](http://www.cedar.nl/pro)).*

*No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.*

Dedicated to my two wonderful sons, Sebastiaan and Samuel.





## Acknowledgements

I would like to thank firstly my two brilliant supervisors, Professor Marielle Bruning and Professor Elies van Sliedregt. Thank you both for your dedication to this project and for making time in your tight agendas to meet with me, read my drafts and give me your needed and much appreciated guidance. Your enthusiasm motivated me to embark in this endeavour and has made the process of writing this thesis a life-enriching experience. I consider myself privileged to have you both as my supervisors, combining the best of your expertise: children's rights and international criminal law. I could have not asked for a better team to guide me throughout this Ph.D. process.

My thanks for the respectable members of the Ph.D. Committee: Prof. dr. L. van den Herik, Prof. dr. W.A. Schabas, Prof. dr. T. Liefwaard, Prof. dr. J.E. Doek, and Judge Silvia A. Fernández de Gurmendi, for reviewing my manuscript and providing me with valued comments that have without a doubt enriched this thesis.

Many thanks to my colleagues at the International Criminal Court, for their support throughout this process. I particularly thank my former supervisor and mentor, Judge Odio Benito, for her relentless support and her vision of an ICC that is fully compromised with human rights and with gender justice.

To conclude, I would like to thank those persons in my personal life that have also supported and encouraged me in this challenging process. Firstly my parents, who have sponsored my academic career and who have always assured me that I could achieve this life-long dream. To my husband, for being a great partner and a fantastic dad to our sons. Thanks for your dedication to our family when my long working hours would not allow me to be there as a mom.

Cynthia Chamberlain  
January 2014



# Table of Contents

LIST OF ACRONYMS	XIII
INTRODUCTION	1
1 Necessity and Legal Basis for the Inclusion of a Children’s Rights Perspective in ICC Proceedings	1
2 Aim of the Research and Statement of the Problem	6
3 The Concept of “Child victims and Witnesses”	8
4 Research Methodology	11
5 Structure of the Thesis	13
1 CONFLICT AND CHILDREN	15
1.1 Introduction	15
1.2 Children as Victims of Armed Conflict and Gross Violations of Human Rights	16
1.2.1 Violence against children as a method of war	16
1.2.2 Socioeconomic impact of armed conflict on children	19
1.2.3 Refugee and internally displaced children	21
1.3 Children as Participants in Armed Conflict	22
1.4 Children as Key Players in Peace, Reconciliation and Justice Mechanisms	27
1.5 Conclusions	29
2 CHILDREN AND ICC’S STRUCTURE	31
2.1 The Establishment of the ICC	32
2.2 Organisation of the ICC	36
2.2.1 The Assembly of State Parties	36
2.2.2 Presidency and Chambers	37
2.2.3 The Registry	39
2.2.4 The OTP	42
2.3 Child-Sensitive Reading of the Rome Statute and Other ICC Provisions	43
3 APPLICATION OF CHILDREN’S RIGHTS TO THE ICC’S LEGAL FRAMEWORK	47
3.1 Introduction	47
3.2 Introduction to Article 21 of the Rome Statute	50
3.3 The CRC	59

3.4	Applicability of other international instruments	72
3.4.1	International Humanitarian Law Instruments	72
3.4.2	The Paris Principles	73
3.4.3	United Nations Resolutions	79
3.5	Regional Instruments and Case Law	83
3.5.1	Brief introduction to the Regional Human Rights Systems	83
3.5.2	The African Human Rights System	84
3.5.3	Inter-American Human Rights System	86
3.5.3.1	Definition of child	88
3.5.3.2	Special protection of children, particularly during armed conflict and in situations of gross violations of human rights	88
3.5.3.3	Recruitment of children	91
3.5.3.4	Procedural rights of children	92
3.5.3.5	Children's rights to reparation	93
3.5.4	European Human Rights System	96
3.5.5	Case Law of the Special Court for Sierra Leone	101
3.6	Conclusions	104
4	CRIMES UNDER THE JURISDICTION OF THE ICC AND CHILDREN	107
4.1	Introduction	107
4.2	Who are the victims of crimes committed against children?	109
4.3	International crimes in which children are a material element of the crime	113
4.3.1	Genocide by forcibly transferring children of the group to another group	113
4.3.1.1	Brief note on the crime of genocide in general	113
4.3.1.2	The act of genocide of "forcible transfer of children"	114
4.3.2	Enlistment, conscription and use of children under the age of fifteen to participate actively in the hostilities	115
4.3.2.1	Nature of the crimes of enlistment, conscription and use of children to participate actively in the hostilities	116
4.3.2.2	Conscription and enlistment and the controversial element of "voluntariness"	117
	a. Consent as a valid defence	119
	b. Consent is not a valid defence but is legally relevant	120
	c. Consent is impossible and legally irrelevant	122
4.3.2.3	The concept of use of children under the age of 15 to participate actively in hostilities	126
	a. Use as "direct participation"	126
	b. Use as direct and indirect participation but excluding use for other purposes (namely domestic work and sexual violence)	127
	c. Use as "associated with an armed group"	129
	d. "Use" according to the Trial Chamber in the Lubanga case	132
4.3.2.4	Age determination	134

---

4.4	International crimes in which children are disproportionately or more seriously affected	138
4.4.1	Sexual violence	138
4.4.1.1	The underlying acts of sexual violence	142
4.4.1.2	Charges of sexual violence and cumulative charging and duplicity of charges	145
4.4.2	Intentional attacks against schools and other civilian objects and humanitarian objects	148
4.5	Conclusions	150
5	CHILDREN'S INTERACTION WITH THE ICC	153
5.1	Introduction	153
5.2	Reaching out for Children	154
5.3	Participation of Child Victims at the ICC	163
5.3.1	Who is a victim?	164
5.3.2	The application process	172
5.3.3	Legal Representation and Legal Aid	176
5.3.4	Modalities of participation	181
5.3.4.1	Pre-Trial Stage – Investigation	181
5.3.4.2	Pre-Trial Stage – Confirmation of Charges	186
5.3.4.3	Trial Stage	187
5.3.4.4	Appeal Stage	189
5.4	Protection of Child Victims and Witnesses	190
5.4.1	Obligation to protect and support	190
5.4.2	Protective and special measures available to child victims and witnesses	193
5.4.3	Protection and reliability of child witnesses	207
5.5	Reparations to Child Victims	208
5.5.1	Victim beneficiary of reparations	209
5.5.2	Types of reparations and harms	210
5.5.2.1	Restitution	211
5.5.2.2	Compensation	212
5.5.2.3	Rehabilitation	213
5.5.2.4	Other types of reparation	215
5.5.3	Principles on reparations	216
5.5.4	Reparations proceedings	219
5.5	Conclusions	223
6	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	225
6.1	Introduction	225
6.2	Creating a culture of children's rights in international justice	226
6.3	Recognising that children's rights are not optional	228
6.4	Adapting ICC proceedings to Article 12 of the CRC	229
6.5	Preserving the evidence of child witnesses	231
6.6	Protecting children against exploitation	235

---

6.7 Including the plight of children in all ICC cases	236
6.8 Reaching out for children	237
6.9 Guaranteeing active participation of child victims	238
6.10 Providing meaningful, adequate and fair reparations for child victims, their families and communities	240
6.11 Involving States in an ICC Children's Rights Strategy	241
6.12 Concluding remarks	241
GUIDELINES ON CHILDREN AND THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT	243
SUMMARY	249
SAMENVATTING (SUMMARY IN DUTCH)	253
BIBLIOGRAPHY	259
TABLE OF CASE LAW	269
TABLE OF INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS AND RESOLUTIONS	285
CURRICULUM VITAE	293

## List of Acronyms

AFCtHPR	African Court on Human and Peoples' Rights
AFRC	Armed Forces for Revolutionary Council
ASP	Assembly of State Parties
CDF	Civil Defence Forces
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women
CICC	Coalition for an International Criminal Court
CRC	Convention on the Rights of the Child
DRC	Democratic Republic of Congo
ECCC	Extraordinary Chambers in the Courts of Cambodia
ECECR	European Convention on the Exercise of Children's Rights
ECOSOC	United Nation's Economic and Social Council
ECtHR	European Court of Human Rights
GCU	Gender and Children Unit
IACtHR	Inter-American Court of Human Rights
IBA	International Bar Association
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICRC	International Committee of the Red Cross
ICTR	International Tribunal for Rwanda
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for Former Yugoslavia
IDP	Internally displaced persons
ILO	International Labour Organisation
IRS	Initial Response System
JCCD	Jurisdiction, Complementarity and Cooperation Division
NGOs	Non-governmental organisations
OAU	Organisation of African Unity
OPCD	Office of Public Counsel for the Defence
OPCV	Office of Public Counsel for Victims
OTP	Office of the Prosecutor
PrepCom	Preparatory Commission
PIDS	Public Information and Documentation Section
RoC	Regulations of the Court
RoR	Regulations of the Registry
RPE	Rules of Procedure and Evidence
RTFV	Regulations of the Trust Fund for Victims
RUF	Revolutionary United Front
SCSL	Special Court for Sierra Leone
TFV	Trust Fund for Victims

UNGA	United Nations General Assembly
UNHCR	United Nations High Commission on Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNSC	United Nations Security Council
VPRS	Victims Participation and Reparations Section
VWU	Victims and Witnesses Unit