



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

A critical perspective on the reform of Dutch social security law. The case of the Dutch life course arrangement

Eleveld, A.

Citation

Eleveld, A. (2012, November 29). *A critical perspective on the reform of Dutch social security law. The case of the Dutch life course arrangement. The Meijers Research Institute and Graduate School of the Leiden Law School of Leiden University*. Leiden University Press, Leiden. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/20220>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/20220>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/20220> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Eleveld, Anja

Title: A critical perspective on the reform of Dutch social security law : the case of the life course arrangement

Date: 2012-11-29

A critical perspective on the reform
of Dutch social security law



Leiden University Press

Voor mijn ouders

A critical perspective on the reform of Dutch social security law

The case of the life course arrangement

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. P.F. van der Heijden,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 29 november 2012
klokke 16.15 uur

door

Anja Eleveld

geboren te Veendam

in 1966

Promotiecommissie:

Promotor: prof. dr. G.J.J. Heerma van Voss

Co-promotor: dr. D. Howarth (University of Essex, UK)

Overige leden: prof. dr. B. Barentsen

prof. dr. W. van der Burg (Erasmus Universiteit Rotterdam)

prof. dr. K.P. Goudswaard

dr. M.J. van Hulst (Tilburg University)

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Waddinxveen

ISBN 978 90 8728 174 8

e-ISBN 978 94 0060 112 3

© 2012 Anja Eleveld | Leiden University Press

All rights reserved. Without limiting the rights under copyright reserved above, no part of this book may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the written permission of both the copyright owner and the author of the book.

Contents

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	XI
PREFACE	XIII
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Introduction to the central question of this study	1
1.2 Introduction to the sub questions	7
1.3 Overview of the chapters	8
PART I THEORY AND METHODOLOGY	11
2 POSTSTRUCTURALIST AND POST-POSITIVIST APPROACHES TO POLICY ANALYSIS	13
2.1 Logics of Critical Explanation	13
2.1.1 A post-positivist paradigm of explanation	14
2.1.2 Ontology	15
2.1.3 Practices, discourses and logics	18
2.1.4 The LCE research framework	20
2.2 Extension of the logics model	22
2.2.1 Foucault and genealogy	23
2.2.2 The exemplar and rhetoric: Aletta Norval and Ernesto Laclau	26
2.2.3 Post-positivist policy analysis	28
2.3 An introduction to critique	33
3 LABOR OBLIGATION, JUSTICE AND THE FOUNDATIONS OF SOCIAL SECURITY LAW	35
3.1 Introduction	36
3.2 The legal review of Work First projects	39
3.3 John Rawls' views on reciprocity	40
3.4 Stuart White's alternative	44
3.5 Work First revisited	46
3.6 Concluding remarks	48

4	A NORMATIVE EVALUATION OF SOCIAL LAW AND POSTSTRUCTURALIST CRITIQUE	49
4.1	Contemporary political philosophy and social law evaluations	49
4.1.1	Problems of justice based evaluative criteria	50
4.1.2	Jürgen Habermas: deliberative democratic theory	52
4.1.3	The pros and cons of Habermas' theory for normative evaluations	55
4.2	Normativity and ethics in poststructuralist theory	58
4.2.1	Michel Foucault: the ethical subject	58
4.2.2	Ernesto Laclau and Chantal Mouffe: radical democracy	64
4.2.3	William E. Connolly and Aletta Norval: a democratic ethos of engagement	68
4.2.4	Jason Glynos and David Howarth: critical explanation	71
4.3	Conclusion: a poststructuralist alternative for a normative evaluation of law reform	73
4.4	A methodical introduction to the chapters	75
4.4.1	Basic analytical categories in the proposed Poststructuralist Explanatory Framework	75
4.4.2	Analytical steps	76
4.3.3	Policy context and methods	79
PART II	THE EMERGENCE OF NEW IDEAS IN THE POLICY DISCOURSE	81
5	THE ROLE OF RHETORIC AND AFFECT IN POLICY CHANGES. THE CASE OF DUTCH LIFE COURSE POLICY	83
5.1	Introduction	84
5.2	Discourse theory and the use of rhetoric	86
5.3	Data and methods	88
5.4	Dominant discourses and counter-discourses on Dutch social policy	90
5.5	The 'life course perspective' as a research practice	92
5.6	The dispersion of the life course perspective in social security discourse	94
5.7	Analysis of the texts	97
5.7.1	The constitution of reality in the texts	98
5.7.2	Different meanings of life course policy	100
5.7.3	Convergence between the narratives	103
5.7.4	Main conclusions with respect to the textual analysis	105
5.8	The 'life course perspective' and the act of naming	106
5.9	Concluding observations	107

6	CHRISTIANS, FEMINISTS, LIBERALS, SOCIALISTS, WORKERS AND EMPLOYERS: THE EMERGENCE OF AN UNUSUAL DISCOURSE COALITION	109
6.1	Introduction	110
6.2	Methodology: A post-positivist analysis of narratives	111
6.3	The Dutch policy context	113
6.4	The selection of the data and the methods of analysis	114
6.5	Results of the analysis	116
6.5.1	The story on the life course perspective	117
6.5.2	One storyline, five interpretive frames	117
6.5.3	Actors and frames	122
6.6	An explanation on the emergence of a discourse coalition	122
6.7	Implications	123
7	EQUALITY OR ECONOMIC GROWTH? INTERPRETIVE FRAMES IN EMANCIPATION POLICY BETWEEN 1992 AND 2007	127
7.1	Introduction	128
7.2	Policy: frames, values, opinions, problematizations, narratives and figures	129
7.3	Document selection	131
7.4	The interpretive product: problematizations and the use of data	132
7.5	Shifting frames	138
7.6	Synthesis	141
7.7	Implications	143
	PART III THE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE LIFE COURSE ARRANGEMENT	145
8	DISCOURSE THEORY ON IDEAS AND POLICY REFORM: THE CASE OF THE LIFE COURSE ARRANGEMENT	147
8.1	Introduction	148
8.2	Discourse theoretical approaches to change	149
8.3	Methodology	151
8.4	Policy context	153
8.5	The emergence of the idea on the 'life course perspective'	153
8.6	Changed ideas: the aging society narrative	155
8.7	Disagreement, antagonism and compromise	157
8.8	The LCA: 'a monstrous design'	160
8.9	Proposed extensions of the LCA and renewed resistance	161
8.10	The future of individual savings arrangements in the social security system	163
8.11	A discourse theoretical approach to ideas and policy change	164
8.12	Conclusion	165

9	CONFLICTING BASELINE CATEGORIES OF THOUGHT AND THE DEMISE OF THE LIFE COURSE ARRANGEMENT	167
9.1	Introduction	168
9.2	A comparison between the LCA and the Belgian time credit system	170
9.2.1	Both schemes compared	170
9.2.2	One life course discourse, two schemes	174
9.3	A trailer funded by society?	175
9.4	The reform of social security law and conflicting baseline categories of thought	176
9.5	Conclusions	177
	 PART IV GOVERNMENTALITY AND THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE NEW WORKER	 179
10	CONFIGURATIONS OF LIBERAL GOVERNMENTALITY: CONTINUITIES AND DISCONTINUITIES IN CLASSICAL AND NEOLIBERAL DISCOURSES	181
10.1	Introduction	182
10.2	Foucault on liberal government	183
10.3	Classical liberal government and the problem of pauperism	187
10.4	Neoliberal government and the life course discourse	191
10.5	Liberal government: (changing) relationships between freedom and security	194
10.6	Concluding observations	196
	 PART V MAIN FINDINGS, CONCLUSION AND OUTLOOK	 199
11	MAIN FINDINGS, CONCLUSION AND OUTLOOK	201
11.1	The theoretical sub questions	201
11.2	A critical explanation on the establishment of the LCA	203
11.2.1	A persuasive narrative on the emergence of the LCA: an articulation of logics	203
11.2.2	Critique	206
11.3	The Life Course Arrangement as a new governmental technology in the perspective of (neoliberal) governmentality	213
11.4	Conclusion	214
11.5	Outlook	216

SAMENVATTING	221
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER 4 (1) LIST OF INTERVIEWEES	233
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER 4 (2) INTERVIEW THEMES	237
APPENDIX TO CHAPTERS 5 AND 6 ARGUMENTATION STRATEGIES	239
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER 8 (1) DISCURSIVE SHIFT WITHIN CDA	249
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER 8 (2) THE NOVEMBER 2004 AGREEMENT	253
APPENDIX TO CHAPTER 9 BALIMANIFEST 1 (2005) AND BALIMANIFEST 2 (2009)	255
REFERENCES	257
INDEX	271
CURRICULUM VITAE	277

List of Abbreviations

ABW	National Assistance Act
BB	Birth of Biopolitics (Foucault 2008)
CAO	Collective Labor Agreement
CC	Civil Code
CDA	Christian Democratic Appeal (Christian democratic party)
CNV	National Federation of Christian Trade Unions
D66	Democrats 66 (liberal party)
DHA	Discourse Historical Analysis
FNV	Federation of Netherlands Trade Unions
HSS	Hegemony and Socialist Strategy (Laclay and Mouffe 1985)
LCA	Life Course Arrangement
LCE	Logics of Critical Explanation
NGR	Dutch National Family Council
PEF	Poststructuralist Explanatory Framework
PP	Parliamentary Papers
PvdA	Labor Party
SER	Social Economic Council
Star	Labor Foundation
STP	Security Territory, Population (Foucault 2007)
TECENA	Temporary Expert Commission Emancipation
TC	Time Credit scheme
UK	United Kingdom
VNO-NCW	Confederation of Netherlands Industry and Employers
VVD	People's Party for Freedom and Democracy (liberal party)
Wazo	Work and Care Act
WWB	Work and Welfare Act

Preface

Dutch social security law has changed during the last decades. Values of equality and solidarity, which traditionally underpin social security law, are slowly being replaced by the value of individual responsibility. This transformation is embodied in the Life Course Arrangement, an individual savings scheme for (new) social risks, which will be replaced by the Vitality Arrangement in 2013. How can the establishment of the idea of individual savings schemes in Dutch collective social security law be explained? And is it possible to criticize those changes without reverting to some notion of justice? This book seeks to answer these questions through a collection of papers and (theoretical) chapters.

One of the main purposes of the Life Course Arrangement was to enable workers to combine paid work with other activities during their life course. Above all the Life Course Arrangement was aimed at relieving the busy 'rush hour of life', a period when workers are caring for their (small) children as well as their elderly parents and are working on a successful continuation of their career all at the same time. In fact, I found myself in the middle of my own 'rush hour of life' when I studied Labor Law and subsequently conducted my PhD research. Yet, I enjoyed this busy period doing research and writing papers. I am grateful to the Department of Social Law at Leiden University for giving me the opportunity to carry out this research project. I especially want to thank my supervisors, Guus Heerma van Voss from Leiden University and David Howarth from Essex University, and my colleagues of the research program 'Reforming Social Security', funded by the Stichting Instituut Gak, for their support and constructive comments on my work.

I also would like to thank my partner, Nurit, without whom I never would have started and finished this PhD study. My son Lenny, who is now six years old, will probably only remember that we were playing soccer, watching soccer, and buying soccer balls and soccer shirts in the years before he turned seven. So, I guess my 'rush hour of life' will not leave him traumatized.

I hope that you will enjoy reading this thesis.

Anja Eleveld
Leiden, June 2012

