

Promoting Human Rights: National Human Rights Commissions in Indonesia and Malaysia

Setiawan, K.M.P

Citation

Setiawan, K. M. P. (2013, December 12). *Promoting Human Rights: National Human Rights Commissions in Indonesia and Malaysia*. *Meijers-reeks*. Leiden University Pres, Leiden. Retrieved from https://hdl.handle.net/1887/22838

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: License agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the

Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden

Downloaded from: https://hdl.handle.net/1887/22838

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle http://hdl.handle.net/1887/22838 holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Setiawan, Ken Marijtje Prahari

Title: Promoting human rights: National Human Rights Commissions in Indonesia and

Malaysia

Issue Date: 2013-12-12

Promoting Human Rights National Human Rights Commissions in Indonesia and Malaysia

Promoting Human Rights

National Human Rights Commissions in Indonesia and Malaysia

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden, op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker, volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties te verdedigen op donderdag 12 december 2013 klokke 11.15 uur

door

Ken Marijtje Prahari Setiawan

geboren te Jakarta in 1981

Promotiecommissie:

Promotor: prof. dr. J.M. Otto Co-promotor: dr. A.W. Bedner

Overige leden: prof. dr. C. Flinterman (Universiteit Maastricht,

Universiteit Utrecht)

prof. dr. B. Oomen (Universiteit Utrecht)

prof. dr. H.G.C. Schulte Nordholt (Vrije Universiteit

Amsterdam)

dr. A. Whiting (The University of Melbourne, Australia)

The research on which this book is based, and all associated publications, have been made possible through a grant from the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO).

Lay-out: Anne-Marie Krens - Tekstbeeld - Oegstgeest

ISBN 978 90 8728 203 5 e-isbn 978 94 0060 166 6 (pdf) e-isbn 978 94 0060 167 3 (ePub)

© 2013 K.M.P. Setiawan / Leiden University Press

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden verveelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand, of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Voorzover het maken van reprografische verveelvoudigingen uit deze uitgave is toegestaan op grond van artikel 16h Auteurswet 1912 dient men de daarvoor wettelijk verschuldigde vergoedingen te voldoen aan de Stichting Reprorecht (Postbus 3051, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.reprorecht.nl). Voor het overnemen van (een) gedeelte(n) uit deze uitgave in bloemlezingen, readers en andere compilatiewerken (art. 16 Auteurswet 1912) kan men zich wenden tot de Stichting PRO (Stichting Publicatie- en Reproductierechten Organisatie, Postbus 3060, 2130 KB Hoofddorp, www.cedar.nl/pro).

No part of this book may be reproduced in any form, by print, photoprint, microfilm or any other means without written permission from the publisher.

Acknowledgements

My first visit to Indonesia's National Human Rights Commission and the Women's Rights Commission was in 2002. This was a short visit during which I witnessed not only the tireless efforts of the people working there, but also a violent attack by *preman* (hoodlums) on the organisations and the people seeking refuge there. The image of an old woman fainting in front of me, while desperately asking why the attack happened, has been etched into my memory. Little did I know back then that a few years later, Indonesia's National Human Rights Commission, together with its Malaysian counterpart, would become central to my work. I gratefully acknowledge the generous grant from the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO), which made this research financially possible.

Writing this dissertation was a journey that took longer than expected, and was not without hurdles. However, it was an interesting voyage made easier and more pleasant by the many people I met along the way. I had the privilege of conducting this research within the Van Vollenhoven Institute (VVI). From the earliest until the final stages of this research, excellent practical assistance was provided by Marianne Moria, Jan van Olden, Dennis Janssen, Kari van Weeren and Kora Bentvelsen. Invaluable library assistance was provided by Sylvia Holverda and the late Albert Dekker, whose passing was a great loss for the institute. When I first started at the VVI, Julia Arnscheidt was an important mentor while I was finding my way in my research. During my fieldwork in Indonesia, Sandra Moniaga gave me valuable feedback, helping me to further shape my research. In the later stages of this research, I benefited from constructive discussions with Anton Cahyadi, Stijn van Huis and Herlambang Perdana Wiratraman, as well as from Tristam Moeliono's close reading of the theoretical framework. Gustaaf Reerink gave me moral support and practical advice. I am indebted to Jan Michiel Otto and Adriaan Bedner, who made me familiar with and enthusiastic for socio-legal research, and taught me many aspects of the scholarly profession. Adriaan deserves a special mention here, for sharing my fascination of the Indonesian Human Rights Commission, and for patiently providing feedback in what seemed an endless process of (re)writing - first of research proposals and later of this book. For that and your friendship; thank you.

My fieldwork in Jakarta was made much easier by Pak Nalih, who knows the city like the back of his hand, and patiently drove me through what seemed like endless traffic jams. At KOMNAS HAM, I was received with open arms by Atikah Nuraini, Kurniasari Novita Dewi, Heru W. Susanto, Hilmy Rosyida and Roichatul Aswidah, who openly shared their experiences with me. Outside of KOMNAS HAM, I benefited from the insights and kindness of Agung Putri, Indria Fernida and Edisius Riyadi Terre. Throughout my research, I was struck by the willingness of both staff and commissioners to offer their insights to me: a stranger.

Whereas Jakarta was more or less familiar territory, Kuala Lumpur was a new experience for me. Selvi Supramaniam not only provided me with a roof over my head but also, and more importantly, with friendship. At SUHAKAM, I received kind assistance from Puan Zainap, who organised many interviews for me with current and former commissioners. During lunch breaks, it was a pleasure to be in the company of Zety Mazuwani, Abdul Rahman and Raiyan Abdul, who made it their mission to introduce me to the great food Kuala Lumpur has on offer. The sharp analysis of two very talented women, Nurul Hasanah Ahamed and Khoo Ying Hooi, enriched my understanding of the Commission. Outside of SUHAKAM, I was fortunate to learn from Sharmila Sekaran and Andrew Khoo, who never tired of answering my questions and whose commitment, hopes and efforts for a fairer Malaysia were nothing short of an inspiration.

During the course of this project, life brought me to Canberra. There, I was lucky to befriend Monika Winarnita, Angie Bexley, Ana Dragojlovic and Gaik Cheng Khoo. Gaik also kindly shared her insights of Malaysia with me, which was very useful during the course of my research. Paul Tickell, Prapti and Ross McLeod, as well as Inez Nimpuno and Amrih Widodo, and their daughter Anggi, made me feel welcome and helped me find my feet in a new environment.

No matter in which part of the world I was, I could always rely on the Mulder family, who have been a constant source of support. In more recent years, I was fortunate to become part of a warm family-in-law, and my parents-in-law have on many occasions helped with caring for my children while I was doing research. My stepmother Ita F. Nadia has provided me with invaluable help and guidance during my fieldwork in Indonesia and more importantly she, together with Dina, Nisa and Nur, has brought much cheerfulness to our family.

There are simply not enough words to thank my parents, Jitske Mulder and Hersri Setiawan, for their encouragement and unconditional love which made everything possible. I often hold them responsible for this research: they were my first teachers of human rights by raising me with stories of right and wrong. My parents taught me to meet challenges with resilience and optimism, valuable lessons which will always remain an inspiration to me.

Finally, a message from the heart to my little family. My children Setia and Raphael have known nothing but a mother working on her dissertation. Their interest in the process is perhaps best illustrated by their use of the flipsides of draft pages to draw on. They have distracted me from my disserta-

Acknowledgements

tion in every possible way, yet I always came back to my work with more enthusiasm and determination. My husband Edwin has been a loyal companion throughout this journey, and he - more than anyone else - knows it was far from easy. He patiently listened to complaints and was always the first to encourage me to persist and finish the work I had begun. Without Edwin's love and support, I would not have brought this project to a successful end. I dedicate this book to my three best friends: thank you for the life that we share and for making me smile every day.

Table of Contents

	GLOSSARY	XIII		
1	THE NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSIONS OF INDONESIA AND MALAYSIA			
	Introduction, Theoretical Framework and Research Approach	1		
1.1	Introduction			
	1.1.1 National Human Rights Institutions: Popularity and Potential	1		
	1.1.2 Research Questions	2		
	1.1.3 Historical Background of NHRIS	3		
	1.1.4 Research on NHRIS	6		
	1.1.5 Indonesia and Malaysia	9		
1.2	Theoretical Framework	14		
	1.2.1 Human Rights: a Contested Concept	14		
	1.2.2 Human Rights Realisation	17		
	1.2.3 Organisational Performance and Effectiveness	21		
1.3	Research Approach	27		
2	THE 'IRONIC' HISTORY OF KOMNAS HAM			
	The Development of the Indonesian Human Rights Commission,			
	1993-2008	33		
2.1	Introduction	33		
2.2	1993-1998: Genesis of KOMNAS HAM	34		
	2.2.1 Rationale for Establishing an NHRI in Indonesia	34		
	2.2.2 Presidential Decree 50/1993	38		
	2.2.3 Challenges and Achievements: KOMNAS HAM during the			
	New Order	40		
2.3	1998-2001: An Age of Reform	45		
	2.3.1 A Changed Landscape: <i>Reformasi</i> and the Acceptance of			
	International Human Rights	45		
	2.3.2 Challenges and Achievements: KOMNAS HAM under Pressure	50		
2.4	2002-2007: A Strong Human Rights Commission?	54		
	2.4.1 Organisational Developments	54		
	2.4.2 Challenges: KOMNAS HAM's Relationship with the Attorney			
	General	60		
2.5	Developments after 2007: A New Human Rights Commission?	63		
	2.5.1 New Commissioners and Directions	63		
	2.5.2 Fall-out with the Indonesian Armed Forces	65		
2.6	Conclusion	66		

X Table of Contents

3	THE POWER OF THE INDIVIDUAL	(0
2.1	Performance and Effectiveness of KOMNAS HAM in Three Case Studies	69
3.1 3.2	Introduction	69 73
J.Z	KOMNAS HAM and Interreligious Marriage 3.2.1 Interreligious Marriage in Indonesia	73
	3.2.2 KOMNAS HAM's Report on Interreligious Marriage	73 77
	3.2.3 KOMNAS HAM's Report on the National Civil Registry	81
	3.2.4 Performance and Effectiveness	83
3.3	KOMNAS HAM and Fair Trial	87
0.0	3.3.1 The Right to a Fair Trial	87
	3.3.2 KOMNAS HAM and Fair Trial	88
	3.3.3 Performance and Effectiveness	90
3.4	KOMNAS HAM and Adequate Housing in Jakarta	93
	3.4.1 The Right to Adequate Housing	93
	3.4.2 Residential Evictions in Jakarta	95
	3.4.3 KOMNAS HAM and Residential Evictions	99
	3.4.4 KOMNAS HAM's Report on Regional Regulation 8/2007	102
	3.4.5 Performance and Effectiveness	107
3.5	Conclusion	109
4	SEARCHING FOR A SPACE The Development of the Malaysian Human Rights Commission, 1999-2010	113
4.1	Introduction	113
4.2	1999-2000: Genesis of SUHAKAM	114
	4.2.1 Rationale for Establishing an NHRI in Malaysia	114
	4.2.2 The Human Rights Commission of Malaysia Act 1999	118
	4.2.3 Organisational Structure	119
	4.2.4 Challenges and Achievements	121
4.3	2002-2010: Between State and Society	124
	4.3.1 Organisational Development	124
	4.3.2 Main Achievements	127
	4.3.3 Main Challenges	130
	4.3.4 Amendments to the HRCMA 1999	136
	4.3.5 Developments in 2010	137
4.4	Conclusion	138
5	BETWEEN DISREGARD AND EXCELLENCE	
	Performance and Effectiveness of SUHAKAM in Three Case Studies	141
5.1	Introduction	141
5.2	SUHAKAM and Freedom of Religion	142
	5.2.1 Freedom of Religion in Malaysia: a Source of Tension	142
	5.2.2 SUHAKAM and Freedom of Religion	145
	5.2.3 Performance and Effectiveness	148

Table	of Contents	XI
5.3	SUHAKAM and Fair Trial	152
	5.3.1 The Internal Security Act	152
	5.3.2 SUHAKAM's Review of the Internal Security Act	155
	5.3.3 Performance and Effectiveness	158
5.4	SUHAKAM and Adequate Housing	161
	5.4.1 The Right to Adequate Housing in Malaysia	161
	5.4.2 SUHAKAM and the Right to Adequate Housing in Kuala Lumpur	164
	5.4.3 Performance and Effectiveness	170
5.5	Conclusion	172
6	Comparing komnas ham and suhakam	
	Conclusions on the Socialisation of Human Rights, Organisational	
	Performance and Effectiveness	175
6.1	Introduction	175
6.2	Comparing KOMNAS HAM and SUHAKAM	177
	6.2.1 Performance	177
	6.2.2 Effectiveness	184
6.3	Promoting Human Rights	187
Sum	MARY	189
SAME	envatting (Dutch summary)	197
LIST	of References and Interviews	205
APPE	INDICES	221
I	Recommendations	223
II	Suggestions for Future Research	231
Inde	X	233
CURRICULUM VITAE		

Glossary

Where relevant, the glossary includes a reference to the country or NHRC to which the term applies.

ABRI Indonesian Armed Forces

Aliansi Tolak PERDA

Tibum Alliance Rejecting the Regional Regulation on Public

Order (Indonesia)

APF Asia Pacific Forum of NHRIs

BALITBANG Office of Human Rights Research and Development

(Indonesia)

Barisan Alternatif (BA) Alternative Front, coalition of Malaysian opposition

parties

Barisan Nasional (BN) National Front, coalition of Malaysian government parties

Bersih Coalition for Clean and Fair Elections (Malaysia)

BOP Body of Principles for the Protection of All Persons under

any Form of Detention or Imprisonment

Bulubulu Fijian customary practice

Bumiputera Malay and indigenous population (Malaysia)

Bupati District Head (Indonesia)

CAT Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or

Degrading Treatment or Punishment

CDC Community Development Centre (Malaysia)
CEDAW Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of

Discrimination against Women

CERD Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination

CHU Complaint Handling Unit (CHU)

CMW Convention on the Rights of Migrant Workers and their

Families

CPM Communist Party of Malaya (Malaysia)
CRC Convention on the Rights of the Child
DAP Democratic Action Party (Malaysia)

Defensor del Pueblo Type of NHRI, commonly found in Latin America

Demokratisasi Democratisation

Direktorat Jenderal Hak

Asasi Manusia Directorate General for Human Rights (Indonesia)
DP3KK Directorate for the Managing of the Development of the

Kemayoran Complex

Dwifungsi Dual role of the military (Indonesia) ECHR European Court of Human Rights

XIV Glossary

ERA Consumer Education and Research Association for Consumers

(Malaysia)

FAKTA Jakarta City Residents Forum

Fatwa Religious opinion given by Islamic authorities
GANDI Movement for the Struggle Against Discrimination

(Indonesia)

Garis Panduan

Perancangan Universal Guidelines on Planning and Development

dan Pembangunan Sejagat

(Malaysia)

GHR Regulation on Mixed Marriages (Indonesia)

GMI Abolish ISA Movement (Malaysia)

HAKAM National Human Rights Society of Malaysia

Hak asasi manusia Human rights

HINDRAF Hindu Rights Action Front (Malaysia)
HRCL Human Rights Courts Law (Indonesia)
HRCMA Human Rights Commission of Malaysia Act

HRL Human Rights Law (Indonesia)

ICC International Coordinating Committee of National

Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human

Rights

ICCPR International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural

Richts

ICRMW International Convention on the Rights of Migrant

Workers and Members of their Families

ICRP Indonesian Conference on Religion and Peace

ICRPD International Convention on the Rights of Persons with

Disabilities

IFC Interfaith Commission (Malaysia)IMF International Monetary FundISA Internal Security Act (Malaysia)

ISJ Jakarta Social Institute

Isbat nikah Authority of courts to rule a marriage valid (Indonesia)

JAC Judicial Appointments Commission (Malaysia)

JERIT Oppressed People Network (Malaysia)

Kampung Village, urban settlement

Kantor Perwakilan Representative Office of KOMNAS HAM

KCS Civil Registry Office (Indonesia)

Kejaksaan Agung Attorney General's Office (Indonesia)

Kepercayaan Mystic religion (Indonesia)

Keputusan Presiden

or Keppres Presidential Decree (Indonesia)

Keterbukaan Openness (Indonesia) Ketertiban Umum Public Order

KHI Compilation of Islamic Law (Indonesia)

KOMDA HAM Maluku Regional Human Rights Commission of the Moluccas

Komisi III DPR Third Parliamentary Commission (Indonesia)

Glossary XV

KOMNAS Anak National Commission for the Protection of Children

(Indonesia

KOMNAS HAM National Commission on Human Rights (Indonesia) KOMNAS Perempuan National Commission on Violence Against Women

(Indonesia)

Konsortium Catatan

Sipil Nasional Consortium on the National Civil Registry (Indonesia)

KORPRI Indonesian Civil Servants Corps

KK Family Card (Indonesia)

KLCC Kuala Lumpur Convention Centre

KTP Identity Card (Indonesia)

KUA Office of Religious Affairs (Indonesia) KUHAP Criminal Procedure Code (Indonesia)

Kumpul kebo Cohabitation

KY Judicial Commission (Indonesia)
LAA Land Acquisition Act (Malaysia)
LBH Legal Aid Institute (Indonesia)
LINMAS Community Protectors (Indonesia)
MCA Malaysian Chinese Association
MIC Malaysian Indian Congress
MK Constitutional Court (Indonesia)

MP Member of Parliament MUI Indonesian Council of Ulama

Musyawarah mufakat Consultation and consensus-making (Indonesia)

NAM Non-aligned Movement

NEP New Economic Policy (Malaysia)
NGO Non-governmental Organisation
NHRC National Human Rights Commission
NHRI National Human Rights Institution
NJOP Sales Value of Tax Object (Indonesia)
NLC National Land Code (Malaysia)

NRD National Registration Department (Malaysia)
OHCHR Office of the High Commissioner on Human Rights

OPM Free Papua Movement (Indonesia)
Operasi Lalang Mass arrest of dissidents (1987, Malaysia)

OSA Official Secrets Act (Malaysia)

Orang Asal Indigenous peoples of Sabah and Sarawak
Orang Asli Indigenous peoples of the Malaysian Peninsula

Pancasila Indonesian state ideology PAS Islamic Party of Malaysia

PAWANG Alliance of Residents Against Evictions (Indonesia)

Partai Hati Nurani

Rakyat People's Conscience Party (Indonesia)

PDI Indonesian Democratic Party Pegawai Negeri Sipil Civil servant (Indonesia)

Pembangunan Development

Pelatihan Hak Asasi

Manusia Dasar Basic human rights training (KOMNAS HAM)

XVI Glossary

Pelecehan terhadap

agama Insult to religion

Penduduk KekalPermanent residents (Malaysia)Pengadilan NegeriDistrict Court (Indonesia)PenggusuranEviction (Indonesia)

PenghayatFollowers of animistic religions (Indonesia)Peraturan Tata TertibRules of Procedure (KOMNAS HAM)PERDARegional Regulation (Indonesia)

Perkawinan campuran Mixed marriages
Pernikahan beda agama Interreligious marriage

Perwakilan Representation (form of regional office of KOMNAS

HAM)

PKI Indonesian Communist Party
PKN National Justice Party (Malaysia)
PKR People's Justice Party (Malaysia)

PPP Unity and Development Party (Indonesia)
PPPA Printing Presses and Publication Act (Malaysia)

PR Pakatan Rakyat (Malaysia)
Preman Hoodlums (Indonesia)
PRM Malaysian People's Party

PROLEGNAS National Legislation Program (Indonesia)

Provedor Type of NHRI, commonly found in Latin America

PSM Socialist Party of Malaysia
PTUN Administrative Court (Indonesia)
PUSHAM Human Rights Study Centre (Indonesia)

Rancangan Undang-

Undang Catatan Draft Law on the National Civil Registry (Indonesia)

Sipil Nasional

RANHAM National Action Plan on Human Rights (Indonesia)

Reformasi Reform', motto of domestic opposition in Indonesia and

Malaysia, particularly in 1998

RELA Association of Volunteers of the Malaysian People
RPJMN Medium Term National Development Plan (Indonesia)
RPJPN Long Term National Development Plan (Indonesia)

RSS Very Simple House (Indonesia) SATPOL PP Municipal Police Unit (Indonesia)

SMR Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners

SNAP Sarawak National Party (Malaysia)
Staf Fungsional Functional staff (KOMNAS HAM)
Staf Struktural Structural staff (KOMNAS HAM)
SUARAM Voice of the Malaysian People

SUHAKAM Human Rights Commission of Malaysia

Surat Edaran Menteri

Dalam Negeri Circular Letter of the Minister of Home Affairs
Surat Tugas Task Letter, official document required to commence a

task (KOMNAS HAM)

TRAMTIB Police Unit for Peace and Order (Indonesia)
UDHR Universal Declaration on Human Rights

Glossary XVII

UMNO United Malays National Organisation (Malaysia)

UN United Nations

UNCHR United Nations Commission on Human Rights

UNHRC United Nations Human Rights Council
UPC Urban Poor Consortium (Indonesia)
Warung Shop on the side of the street (Indonesia)
Wawasan 2020 Vision 2020, Malaysian development policy