



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The state practice of India and the development of international law : selected areas

Patel, B.N.

Citation

Patel, B. N. (2015, May 21). *The state practice of India and the development of international law : selected areas*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/33019>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/33019>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/33019> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

Author: Patel, Bimalkumar Natvarlal

Title: The state practice of India and the development of international law : selected areas

Issue Date: 2015-05-21

**THE STATE PRACTICE OF INDIA AND THE
DEVELOPMENT OF INTERNATIONAL LAW:
SELECTED AREAS**

BIMAL N. PATEL

**THE STATE PRACTICE OF INDIA AND THE
DEVELOPMENT OF INTERNATIONAL LAW:
SELECTED AREAS**

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 21 mei 2015
klokke 11.15 uur

door

Bimalkumar Natvarlal PATEL

geboren te Khadol (Gujarat), India

in 1970

Promotiecommissie:

Promotor: Prof. Dr. N.J. Schrijver

Overige leden: Prof. Dr. C.J.M. Arts (IISS, Erasmus University Rotterdam)

Prof. Dr. W.J.M. van Genugten (Tilburg University)

Prof. Dr. J. Gupta (University of Amsterdam)

Prof. Dr. A. van Staden

Prof. Dr. S. P. Subedi (University of Leeds, UK)

Acknowledgments

This research study has its genesis in the motivating words of Mr C. Jayaraj, Principal State Counsel, Department of Legal Affairs, Seychelles and the former Secretary-General of the Indian Society of International Law (ISIL). During his tenure as the Secretary-General, Mr Jayaraj undertook an important drive to promote research and training of international law in India. He himself undertook some research work, but most importantly, kept encouraging researchers to study India's contribution to development of international law. Mr Amal Ganguli, Senior Advocate, Supreme Court of India, has been another important motivator who, while having a very busy practice at the Supreme Court of India and abroad, kept writing and emphasizing importance of awareness of international law in the judiciary and the Bar at large. Their encouragement led me to prepare and edit two volumes on India and International Law published in 2005 and 2008 respectively by Nijhoff. Two individual chapters published in these two volumes and one chapter published in the Oxford *Handbook on History of International Law* have been revised and enriched in terms of content and scope and are included in this dissertation. It is my personal privilege to dedicate this thesis to them for all their encouragements and intellectual friendship.

Professor Nico Schrijver, Leiden University, whom I know for over 22 years, from the days of his tenure at the Institute of Social Studies in The Hague, encouraged me to study international law. His commitment for multilateralism and rule of international law, deeply rooted in Dutch legal traditions, coupled with a deep sense of faith and guidance have remained a single source of inspiration and support in pursuing this research study. Distance does not matter in pursuing scholarly endeavours and this has proven true in this case. Over numerous personal and internet meetings and exchanges, Professor Schrijver has ensured that I live up to his research and scholarly expectations. This thesis is a drop in an ocean contribution to a wonderful friend, teacher, practitioner and intellectual guide – Professor Nico Schrijver. I am grateful to Professor Rick Lawson, Dean of Faculty of Law of the Leiden University and to Professor Karin Arts, Professor Willem van Genugten, Professor Joyeeta Gupta, Professor Alfred van Staden and Professor Surya Subedi, the members of the PhD Promotion Committee, for their critical comments and suggestions.

I express my deep gratitude to Ms Esther Uiterweerd, Ms E. M. E ten Donkelaar and Ms H. J. Boumlak, University of Leiden, for their academic coordination and secretarial support. I am grateful to Mr Vijay Waghela, my personal assistant who ensured timely printing, binding and transmission of drafts of the dissertation and the final version to the Leiden University.

Rupal, my wife and Bittu and Om – our two sons - have been testimony to my 365 x 24 x 7 work habit. Their love, support and understanding have and will remain my personal source of comfort as I pursue research works in international law. I am very grateful to my larger family members, parents and parents-in-law, other family members in India, Dutch parents Ben and Bep, and family friends in Holland for their encouragement and appreciation to my research endeavours. Needless to say that all errors are solely my own responsibility.

Dedicated to

Mr Chinnasamy Jayaraj, Principal State Counsel, Republic of Seychelles and
former Secretary-General, Indian Society of International Law, New Delhi,

Mr Amal Ganguli, Senior Advocate, Supreme Court of India

&

to all those who promote scholarly and juristic works on the State Practice of India on International Law.

ABBREVIATIONS

ACWs	Abandoned Chemical Weapons
AFOPS	Asian Forum for Polar Science
AOSIS	Alliance of Small Island States
ATCM	Antarctic Treaty Consultative Meeting
BASIC	Brazil, South Africa, India and China
CBDR	Common But Differentiated Responsibilities
CBW	Convention on Biological Weapons
CCAMLR	Commission for the Conservation of Antarctic Marine Living Resources
CCIT	Comprehensive Convention on International Terrorism
CDM	Clean Development Mechanism
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women
CLCS	Commission on Limits of Continental Shelf
COMNAP	Council of Managers of National Antarctic
CTBT	Comprehensive Test Ban Treaty
CWC	Chemical Weapons Convention
CWDFs	Chemical Weapons Destruction Facilities
CWPFs	Chemical Weapons Production Facilities
CWs	Chemical Weapons
CWSFs	Chemical Weapons Storage Facilities
DROMLAN	Droning Maud Land Air Operators Network
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone
EU	European Union
G20	Group of 20 Countries
GCTS	Global Counter Terrorism Strategy
GFF	Global Environment Facility
GHG	Green House Gas
IAEA	International Atomic Energy Agency
ICAO	International Civil Aviation Organisation
ICC	International Criminal Court
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
ICJ	International Court of Justice
ICTY	International Criminal Tribunal for former Yugoslavia
ICWA	Indian Council on World Affairs
IEA	International Energy Agency
IMF	International Monetary Fund
IMO	International Maritime Organisation

ISA	International Seabed Authority
ISIL	Indian Society of International Law
ITLOS	International Tribunal for the Law of the Sea
JGOFS	Data Buoy Programme and Joint Global Ocean Flux Studies
LDCs	Least Developed Countries
MARSIS	Marine Satellite Information Services
NAM	Non Aligned Movement
NCAOR	National Center for Antarctic and Ocean Research
NCEP	National Committee on Environmental Planning
NCEPC	National Committee on Environmental Planning and Coordination
NGOs	Non-Governmental Organisations
NHRC	National Human Rights Commission
NIEO	New International Economic Order
NOIS	National Ocean Information System
NPT	Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons
OCWs	Old Chemical Weapons
ODA	Overseas Development Assistance
OECD	Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development
OPCW	Organisation for the Prohibition of Chemical Weapons
PIL	Public Interest Litigation
PKO	Peace Keeping Operations
RTI	Right to Information
SAARC	South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation
SCALOP	Standing Committee of Antarctic and Logistic Operations
SELMAM	Sea Level Monitoring and Modelling
UDHR	Universal Declaration of Human Rights
UN	United Nations
UNCED	United Nations Conference on Environment and Development
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on the Law of the Sea
UNCTAD	United Nations Conference on Trade and Development
UNDP	United Nations Development Program
UNESCO	United Nations Education, Social and Cultural Organisation
UNFCC	United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change
UNHCR	United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees
UNHRC	United Nations Human Rights Council
WMD	Weapons of Mass Destruction
WTO	World Trade Organisation

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgments	5
Abberviations	7

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION, RESEARCH INQUIRY, SCOPE, LIMITATION AND METHODOLOGY

Introduction	15
State Practice an essential requirement of Customary International Law	15
India's Search for Making of International Law	18
India's Attitude to Fundamental Definition of International Law	20
Constitution of India, International Law and State Practice	20
Research Questions	24
Mapping the Influence of Scholarly Debates and Institutional Machineries on State Practice of India	25
Selection of Issues areas: Scope of Research	31
Organization of the Dissertation	32

CHAPTER II

HISTORY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW IN PRE-1945 INDIA

Introduction	35
Salient features or developments bearing the most important influence on the international law that evolved and practiced in India	36
Geographical scope of inquiry	39
Basis of international law	39
Disappearance of British common law from international law practice of independent India	39
Sources of international law in pre-1945 India	43
Sources of international law in ancient India and their influence on post-Independence India	44
Concepts of international law	46
International Law Making through Treaties	47
Administration of Justice and International Law	54
Principles and Practices of criminal law	
Religion and international law	
Diplomacy	
Human rights	
Cooperation among princely states: a metaphor of functioning of international organizations in the post-1945 era	
War and peace	
Trade, commerce and economy	

Administration of justice and international law	
Private international law	56
State Responsibility	57
Concluding remarks	58

CHAPTER III LAW OF THE SEA

Introduction	60
India and the Basic Issues on the Law of the Sea	64
Territorial sea	
Contiguous zone	
Exclusive Economic Zone	
Seabed mining	
Offshore Oil and Gas	
Continental shelf	
Prior Notification for foreign warships passing through the territorial sea	
Common Heritage of Mankind	
Indian position and interests and the Law of the Sea Convention of 1982	68
India's position on issues of non-significance interests	69
Establishment of Designated or Special Areas	
Domestic laws of India on Maritime	72
Implementation of the Law of the Sea Convention provisions and possible conflicts	73
Enforcement Challenges	78
Climate Change and Maritime Boundary Issues	80
Role of the Indian Judiciary and the Law of the Sea Convention	81
Maritime Zone Act 1981	84
India at Law of Sea Convention Forums	87
Ratification issue	89
Challenges	90
Concluding remarks	91

CHAPTER IV REFUGEE LAW

Introduction	93
Facts and Figures	94
International legal regime on Refugees	95
Legislative and Regulatory Framework of India	99
Policy and Practices by the Executive Organs	102

Refugee Issue as an Important Factor in the Foreign Policy of India	105
Role of the Judiciary on International Refugee Law	107
Concluding remarks	113

CHAPTER V HUMAN RIGHTS

Introduction	116
Rights of the Marginalised	119
Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ESCR)	120
Right to Food	121
Social security	122
Public health	122
Education	123
Right to Habitat	124
Right to transparent and accountable governance	124
Rights of Indigenous People	129
Issues concerning women	132
Economic Rights – a way forward for women empowerment in India	136
Rights of Children	136
Concluding remarks	139

CHAPTER VI INTERNATIONAL ENVIRONMENTAL LAW

Introduction	146
Evolution of Environmental Law in India	146
Right to Healthy Environment	152
India's contribution to important international environmental law principles: Strict and absolute liability	154
Role of the Indian Judiciary	155
Bhopal Gas Disaster and its Importance on the International Environmental Law and Jurisprudence	155
Absolute Liability Principle	157
Sustainable development	168
Precautionary and Polluter Pays Principle	164
Precautionary Principle	164
Precautionary Principle Replaced the Assimilative Capacity Principle	166
Polluter Pays Principle	170
Concluding remarks	171

CHAPTER VII INTERNATIONAL CLIMATE CHANGE LAWS

Introduction	175
Issues and Challenges	176

Implementation of climate regime at domestic level	181
Climate Change Negotiations and India	185
Concluding remarks	187

CHAPTER VIII

Laws of Disarmament of the Weapons of Mass Destruction: A Case Study of Chemical Weapons Convention

Introduction	192
Overview of the Chemical Weapons Convention	193
Regime on the destruction of chemical weapons and destruction and/or conversion of chemical weapons production facilities	194
Initial declaration on CW programmes	195
Annual Plans, Reports and Detailed Facility Information	195
Declarations with regards to CWPF programme	196
CW Defense Programme of India	197
Challenges to prevent proliferation of chemical weapons	198
Government control and problem of enforcement with non-proliferation	199
Lacunae in Indian CWC Act	200
International Cooperation and Assistance and the Promotion of peaceful uses of chemistry	200
Administrative, legal, and organizational matters	202
Implementation of international obligations at national level	204
Universality of the CWC and role of India	209
India, Chemical Weapons and International Law	210
India, CWC, and Peace Dividend	211
Concluding remarks	213

CHAPTER IX

INDIA AND THE UNITED NATIONS REFORMS (2005-2012)

Introduction	215
Linkage between UN Reforms and International Law in General and Laws of International Organisation in Particular	215
UN Reforms: Definition and Meaning	218
India's role in the current reform exercise: Understanding the aspirations of a rising global power	219
Why India views the current reform exercise an extremely important one?	221
India's proposals in the current reform exercise	222
India & Reform of the Security Council	224
Economic Development	229
Rationale of the Indian position on reforms on economic issues	230
Peacekeeping operations	236
Peace Building Commission (PBC)	240
Humanitarian intervention and relief	241
Terrorism	243
Administrative and inter-institutional reforms	245
UN Outreach	247
Use of strategies and public relations campaign to achieve the objectives: A critical appraisal	248

Limitations of India	252
Achievements	252
Indian State Practice and Functioning of Group of 20	252
Concluding remarks	257

CHAPTER X INTERNATIONAL COURT OF JUSTICE AND INDIA

Introduction	260
Indian Position on the Role and Functioning of the Court	260
India as a Party in the Contentious Cases: A Short Description	264
Indian Position on the Legal Rules and Principles in the Contentious Cases	265
Preference for Diplomatic Negotiations	271
ICJ Advisory Proceedings	272
Concluding remarks	280
Texts of the Successive Indian Declaration of Acceptance of the Compulsory jurisdiction of ICJ: An evolution	282

CHAPTER XI CONCLUSIONS

General	286
Distinct Approach of Judiciary and Executive to International Law	289
Post-Independence Practice of India: A Rising Power Approach to International Law	289
Use and Effectiveness of the Proactive versus Reactive Approaches to Ensure Desired Outcomes	291
India will continue to avoid the ICJ as a means of Dispute Settlement	292
Patience and Persistence: Virtues of Statecraft in the UN Reforms	292
Permanent Membership of the Security Council: Success Chances are Stronger than Ever Before	293
Law of the Sea: Reflection of a Growing Hegemonic Power	294
India will continue to shape and implement international law of human rights in its own way and pace	295
International Environmental Law: Tension will continue between the Executive and Judiciary	297
Disarmament: India will continue to Insist for Non-Discriminatory Truly Disarmament Instrument while remaining Ambivalent in Its Practices	300
International Law offers India Benign Tools to Promote National Interest	301
India: Alternating between Idealist and Realist Postures	304
International Law to Help Achieve India – Developed Nation Status by 2020	306
Bibliography	310
Important Domestic Legislations	338
Table of Cases	342
Summary in Dutch	353
Curriculum Vitae	364

