



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The great depression in Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay: revisiting vulnerabilities and policies

Gerona Morales, M.E.; Sosa Clavijo, S.M.

Citation

Gerona Morales, M. E., & Sosa Clavijo, S. M. (2015, October 1). *The great depression in Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay: revisiting vulnerabilities and policies*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/35598>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/35598>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/35598> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

Authors: Marcelo Esteban Gerona Morales and Silvana María Sosa Clavijo

Title: The great depression in Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay : revisiting vulnerabilities and policies

Issue Date: 2015-10-01

THE GREAT DEPRESSION IN

ARGENTINA, BRAZIL AND URUGUAY

REVISITING VULNERABILITIES AND POLICIES

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van

de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden

op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,

volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties

te verdedigen op 1 oktober

door

Marcelo Esteban Gerona Morales

geboren te Buenos Aires, Argentina, in 1973

klokke 10:00 uur

Silvana María Sosa Clavijo

geboren te Maldonado, Uruguay, in 1976

klokke 11:15 uur

Promotiecommissie

Promotor:

Prof. dr. Richard T. Griffiths

Overige leden:

Mw. Prof. dr. Madeleine Hosli

Prof. dr. C.G. (Kees) Koonings (Universiteit van Utrecht)

Dr. J. Th. (Thomas) Lindblad

Prof. dr. P. (Patricio) Silva

For Esteban and Francisco, the engines of our lives, for the light of their eyes.

For our mothers, Lelis and Elsa, for everything.

Contents

I.	Introduction.....	9
i.	The focus of our work.....	11
ii.	A world of information to explore	25
iii.	Methodology and statistical shortcomings: against the odds	30
	Part One – Our research framework.....	41
II.	The conceptual framework.....	43
i.	Channels of economic transmission.....	45
Income or trade	45	
Interest rates	46	
Exchange rates: competitiveness and prices	47	
Capital flows contagion	47	
Worker remittances	48	
Transmission channels and country vulnerability.....	49	
ii.	Beyond economics: power and interdependence	51
iii.	The mechanics of the gold standard.....	57
iv.	Structural constraints.....	59
The changing patterns of dependence: Latin American structuralism.....	60	
Wallerstein’s world - system.....	64	
v.	Conclusion	68
III.	The historical framework of the Great Depression.....	71
i.	All mighty national interest	73
ii.	The failure of multilateral diplomacy	79
iii.	Latin America: a lottery ticket	83
iv.	The Financial Crisis of 2008: Déjà vu?.....	89
v.	Conclusion	97
IV.	Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay in perspective.....	99
i.	Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay in the world of the thirties	99
ii.	Same players, different numbers.....	105

iii.	Testing the patterns of trade dependence	110
iv.	Conclusion	120
	Part Two – Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay before the crash	123
V.	Argentina in the road to the infamous decade.....	127
i.	A South American big player.....	129
ii.	The undermined prosperity	133
iii.	The mirror of the vulnerabilities	144
iv.	Conclusion	150
VI.	Brazil, the United States of Coffee and Milk.....	153
i.	The sunset of an old Republic.....	153
ii.	It’s all about coffee. Isn’t it?	157
iii.	A golden illusion	162
iv.	Conclusion	165
VII.	Uruguay in between	169
i.	A paternalistic State’s guidance.....	170
ii.	Structural vulnerability and policies	176
iii.	Conclusion	181
	Part Three – A complex vulnerability during the Great Depression	183
VIII.	Political turmoil and revolutions in Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay	185
i.	A politic maze in Argentina	185
ii.	The rise of mate in Brazil.....	191
iii.	Executive power’s tensions in Uruguay.....	197
iv.	Conclusion	202
IX.	Trade vulnerability and the transmission of the worldwide collapse.....	205
i.	The collapse of trade	205
ii.	The fiscal bottleneck	219
iii.	The economic contraction.....	223
iv.	Conclusion	231
X.	Building a casket for the gold standard.....	237
i.	The role of the core countries	240
ii.	Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay, leading the flight.....	248
	Devaluation, depletion of foreign reserves and exchange control	248

The closure of the Currency Board and exchange control in Argentina.....	257
Short-lived allegiance to gold in Brazil	264
Uruguay and the dilemma of the exchange rate.....	270
iii. Conclusion	278
XI. Heterodox policies from the semi-periphery	281
i. Argentina: radical remedies or dangerous weapons?.....	281
ii. Brazil: between coffee and the gold standard stubbornness	293
iii. Uruguay and the pressure of the circumstances.....	303
iv. Conclusion	307
XII. Trade policies and diplomacy from the semi-periphery	313
i. Foreign trade policies and dependence	313
ii. More tariffs and discrimination against ABU.....	319
iii. Between the British and the Americans	333
iv. Global, hemispheric and regional trade negotiations	347
v. Conclusion	354
XIII. A link to the present, the Great Depression vs. the Financial Crisis of 2008	357
XIV. Endgame: concluding remarks.....	369
i. A summary of the transmission belts of the Great Depression (1928-1934).....	369
ii. The ex-ante economic vulnerabilities of Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay	373
iii. Complex vulnerabilities for Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay	374
Argentina.....	375
Brazil.....	378
Uruguay.....	382
iv. The need for a complex vulnerability approach.....	387
Annex I Timelines	397
Annex II Comparison of ABU's policies during the Great Depression.....	401
Annex III Great Depression vs. the Financial Crisis of 2008.....	407
List of tables	413
List of figures	415
List of pictures.....	416
Archivalia	417
Bibliography.....	419

Curriculum vitae.....	447
Summary	449
Samenvatting	452

Acknowledgments

Many people and institutions contributed to this work and we feel deeply grateful to them. Firstly and specially, we thank our sons, Esteban and Francisco, who patiently witnessed the hardships of two foolish parents who one day decided to engage in a Ph.D. research project. Hopefully, in the future they will eventually understand everything and perhaps they will exceed our inquisitiveness.

We thank Alex Boxell, from *Universiteit Leiden*, who polished our English text and managed not to fall asleep after so many pages of economic history, and to Veronika Tarjan, also from the same university, who helped us in the first stage of our literature review. Moreover, we extend our most sincere gratitude to Ambassador Carlos Mora, who not only encouraged our project from the beginning, but also gave us helpful comments, books and information. Also thanks to Ambassador Álvaro Moerzinger for his understanding. Thanks to the advisor to the Presidency of the Central Bank of Argentina, Arturo O'Connell, a professional who, with his valuable experience, enriched our research with relevant information and useful comments; to Professor Renato Colistete from the Department of Economy of the *Universidade de São Paulo* (USP), Brazil, who gave us key and accurate information about the main debates surrounding the role of coffee in the Brazilian recovery; to Professors Luis Bértola and Raúl Jacob from the Multi-disciplinary Unit of the Faculty of Social Sciences of the *Universidad de la República* (UdelaR), Montevideo, Uruguay, who provided key references and guidance that helped to complete our work on Uruguay. Furthermore, to Paola Azar, for her outstanding support with working papers and databases, among other things, and to Magdalena Bertino and Carolina Román, from the Economic History Department of the Institute of Economics of the Faculty of Economic Sciences and Management of the UdelaR for their support with documents and useful references.

We would like to mention Laura Schelotto, from the library of the Central Bank of Uruguay, Montevideo, Uruguay, who granted us access to documents reserved for researchers; Tamara Sulaque from the Department of Economics of the *Universidad San de Andrés*, Buenos Aires, Argentina, who provided useful documents on Argentina and Roberto Cataldo from the specialized bookstore, 'El Galeón' in Montevideo, who found for us some hidden and forgotten books of historical value. Also thanks to Peter B. Meyer, Research Economist, and Sarah Megorden, Economist, from the Office of Productivity and Technology, and Michael McCarthy from the Division of Major Sector Productivity, all of them from the US Bureau of Labor Statistics who gave references and valuable ideas; and to Andrei Barac, Editor of the Monthly Bulletin of Statistics from the United Nations Statistics Division in New York, the United States, for providing key references.

Following with the support of so many institutions, we would like to thank the staff from the library of the Faculty of Social Sciences of the *Universidad de la República* (UdelaR); from the library of the *Instituto Artigas del Servicio Exterior* of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of

Uruguay, both of them in Montevideo; and from the library *Hernán Santa Cruz* from the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC/UN) in Santiago de Chile, Chile, who provided important references and documents. Also we thank the staff from *Universiteit Leiden*, who always opened the door to our curiosity; in particular we much appreciate the support of the staff from the main library of the university. We are grateful to the staff from *Koninklijke Bibliotheek - Nationale Bibliotheek van Nederland* and from *Bibliotheek van Het Vredespaleis*, both of them in The Hague, the Netherlands. We appreciate the kindness and support of the staff from the National Archives at Kew, Richmond, England; from the National Bureau of Economic Research (NBER) in Cambridge, the United States; and from the Groningen Growth and Development Centre of the *Rijksuniversiteit Groningen* in Groningen, the Netherlands, and in particular Jutta Bolt from the Faculty of Economics and Business who gave important support in methodological aspects. Also our appreciation goes to the nice people of the Netherlands for making possible the perfect environment to do Ph.D. research and we have to apologize for not mentioning all the wonderful people we met there.

Finally, we give special praise to our friend Amalia Flores for her sincerity, understanding, kindness and all the hours that she looked after our child Esteban while we were engaged in studying; to our beloved mothers who from our country, Uruguay, have followed our progress, and to Héctor Gerona, Marcelo's father, who from Heaven is rejoicing with our achievements.

Foreword

The structure of this work is as follows. In the introduction we the authors Marcelo Gerona and Silvana Sosa present the aim of the research, the hypothesis, the constituting elements of a new concept of complex vulnerability that we deem appropriate to analyse de experience of Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay (ABU) during the Great Depression, the sources of information and the methodology with the respective shortcomings. Then the rest of the text is divided in three parts. Part One includes the chapters concerning the conceptual and historical background of our research. Chapter II contains the conceptual framework that guides our work. Further in Chapter III we write about the historical framework of the Great Depression, with a special emphasis on Latin America, and making a link to the financial crisis that broke out in 2008. In Chapter IV we put Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay in perspective by comparing the economies and structure of commerce between the thirties and the period 2007-2010. Then, in Part Two we describe the situation of Argentina, Brazil and Uruguay before the crash in chapters V, VI and VII, respectively. Part Three constitutes the core of our research as in it we seek to analyse the complex vulnerability of the three countries, including political aspects (Chapter VIII), transmission of the crisis from the core (Chapter IX), the role of the gold standard ideology (Chapter X), the policies applied to mitigate the negative impact of the crisis (Chapter XI) and the influence of the patterns of complex interdependence that linked each country to the world-system (Chapter XII). In our Chapter XIII we make a link to the Financial Crisis of 2008 by comparing it with the Great Depression of 1929. Finally and always taking into account each of the elements that shape our concept of complex vulnerability, some concluding remarks are presented, focused on the experience of Uruguay as the smallest country, and applying a historical-comparative approach with the other two major neighbours.

In compliance with Leiden University's regulations, the text should be attributed as follows. Both co-authors jointly wrote the different sections of Chapter I (Introduction). In Chapter II (The conceptual framework), Silvana Sosa worked on the channels of economic transmission and the mechanics of the gold standard, whereas Marcelo Gerona tackled the section on power and interdependence and structural constraints. In Chapter III (The historical framework of the Great Depression) Marcelo Gerona wrote the first section mainly about national policies and the second regarding the failure of multilateral diplomacy, whereas Silvana Sosa addressed in Chapter III the experience of Latin America and the link with the Financial Crisis of 2008. Sections i) and ii) of Chapter IV were written by both co-authors, but Section iii) (testing the patterns of trade dependence) was the responsibility of Marcelo Gerona. From then on, the text regarding Argentina shall be attributed to Silvana Sosa, that on Brazil to Marcelo Gerona, and the remaining text concerning Uruguay, or wherever a comparison between these countries is made, shall be considered as a joint work of both co-authors. Consequently, Silvana Sosa is responsible for Chapter V, Section i) of Chapter VIII, various parts of Chapter IX, part of Section ii) of Chapter X, Section i) of Chapter XI and parts of Chapter XII. Marcelo Gerona wrote Chapter VI, Section ii) of Chapter VIII, various parts of Chapter IX, part of Section ii) of

Chapter X, Section ii) of Chapter XI and parts of Chapter XII. The remainder of the text, including Chapter VII, Section iii) of chapter VIII, various parts of Chapter IX, parts of Section ii) of Chapter X, Section iii) of Chapter XI, parts of Chapter XII and Chapter XIII, as well as the concluding Chapter XIV, shall be considered a joint responsibility of Silvana Sosa and Marcelo Gerona.