



Universiteit
Leiden

The Netherlands

Tenure Security for Indonesia's Urban Poor : a socio-legal study on land, decentralisation, and the rule of law in Bandung

Reerink, G.O.

Citation

Reerink, G. O. (2011, December 13). *Tenure Security for Indonesia's Urban Poor : a socio-legal study on land, decentralisation, and the rule of law in Bandung*. Meijers-reeks. Leiden University Press (LUP), Leiden. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/18325>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/18325>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Tenure security for Indonesia's urban poor

*A socio-legal study on land, decentralisation,
and the rule of law in Bandung*



Leiden University Press

The research this book is based on and its publication have been made possible by grants from the Netherlands Royal Academy of Sciences (KNAW), the Netherlands Organisation for Scientific Research (NWO), the Society for the Advancement of Research in the Tropics (Treub-Maatschappij), the Royal Netherlands Institute of Southeast Asian and Caribbean Studies / Adat Law Foundation (KITLV / Adatrechtstichting), the Leiden University Fund (LUF), and the Faculty of Law, Leiden University.

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Waddinxveen

ISBN 978 90 8728 152 6

eISBN 978 94 0060 071 3

© 2011 Gustaaf Reerink | Leiden University Press

All rights reserved. Without limiting the rights under copyright reserved above, no part of this book may be reproduced, stored in or introduced into a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means (electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise) without the written permission of both the copyright owner and the author of the book.

Tenure Security for Indonesia's Urban Poor

*A socio-legal study on land, decentralisation,
and the rule of law in Bandung*

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. P.F. van der Heijden,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 13 december 2011
klokke 15:00 uur

door

Gustaaf Olivier Reerink

geboren te Dwingeloo

in 1978

Promotiecommissie:

Promotor: Prof. dr. J.M. Otto

Co-promotor: Dr. A.W. Bedner

Overige leden: Prof. mr. A.G. Castermans

Dr. F. Colombijn (Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam)

Prof. dr. D. Fitzpatrick BA LLB LLM (Australia National
University, Canberra, Australia)

Prof. dr. T. Rahmadi SH LLM (Universitas Andalas, Padang,
Indonesia)

Contents

LIST OF MAPS, TABLES, AND APPENDICES	IX
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	XI
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS	XIII
1 INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Urban poverty and informality	1
1.2 Tenure security, land registration, and alternative approaches	3
1.3 The need for a rule of law environment	8
1.4 Urban poverty, tenure security, and the rule of law in Indonesia	10
1.5 Research questions	15
1.6 Framework of analysis	15
1.7 Methodologies	17
1.8 Limitations of research	21
1.9 Outline	22
2 MIGRANTS FLOWS, REGULATORY FAILURE A short history of the kampongs of Bandung	25
2.1 Introduction	25
2.2 Autonomous villages in an expanding colonial town	26
2.3 Refugee settlements in an occupied city	32
2.4 Migrant settlements in a decolonising city	34
2.5 Migrant settlements in a metropolitan city	40
2.6 Bandung's kampongs today: a 'challenge of slums'?	48
2.7 Conclusion	53
3 STATE RIGHTS AND INDIVIDUAL OBLIGATIONS A general overview of Indonesian land law	57
3.1 Introduction	57
3.2 Guided Democracy: land law in a state of revolution	58
3.3 The New Order: land law in a 'developmentalist' state	63
3.4 Post-New Order: land law in a decentralised 'Rechtsstaat'?	68
3.4.1 General reforms	68
3.4.2 Regional autonomy	74
3.4.3 Land law reform	82
3.4.4 Access to justice and legal empowerment	85
3.5 Conclusion	87

4	AN 'IDEAL' BEYOND REACH Law and practice of land registration	89
4.1	Introduction	89
4.2	The system of land registration in Indonesia	90
4.3	Sporadic registration and its limits	95
4.4	Systematic registration: set-up of land registration programmes	99
4.5	Reach of land registration programmes	102
4.6	Land registration, tenure security, and the rule of law	104
4.7	Recent reforms related to land registration	112
4.8	Conclusion	117
5	WHEN MONEY RULES OVER VOICE Law and practice of spatial planning	121
5.1	Introduction	121
5.2	Spatial planning under the late New Order	122
5.3	Legal reforms related to spatial planning	128
5.4	Practice of spatial planning in Post-New Order Bandung	131
5.5	Spatial planning, tenure security, and the rule of law	145
5.6	More recent reforms related to spatial planning	153
5.7	Conclusion	156
6	NOT JUST COMPENSATION Law and practice of land clearance by the state	159
6.1	Introduction	159
6.2	Land clearance by the state under the late New Order	159
6.3	Practice of land clearance by the state in Post-New Order Bandung	167
6.4	Land clearance by the state, tenure security, and the rule of law	177
6.5	Recent reforms related to land clearance by the state	181
6.6	Conclusion	185
7	DEALING WITH THE URBAN POOR Law and practice of commercial land clearance	187
7.1	Introduction	187
7.2	Commercial land clearance under the late New Order	188
7.3	Legal reforms related to commercial land clearance	193
7.4	Practice of commercial land clearance in Post-New Order Bandung	196
7.4.1	The Paskal Hyper Square project	197
7.4.2	Land clearance in Kebonjeruk	199
7.4.3	Land clearance in Ciroyom, second zone	202
7.4.4	Land clearance in Ciroyom, third zone	205
7.5	Commercial land clearance, tenure security, and the rule of law	206
7.6	Conclusion	210

8	INVESTING IN KAMPONGS: RISKY BUSINESS? Perceived tenure security and housing consolidation	213
8.1	Introduction	213
8.2	Tenure status and perceived tenure security	214
8.2.1	Perceived legitimacy of tenure	215
8.2.2	Perceived possibility of involuntary removal	216
8.2.3	Perceived possibility to receive compensation entitled to	217
8.3	Changed perceptions of tenure security since the end of the New Order	218
8.4	Housing consolidation	219
8.5	Conclusion	221
9	CONCLUSION	223
9.1	Introduction	223
9.2	Land tenure security of low-income kampong dwellers	223
9.3	Rule of law development at the local level	226
9.4	Indonesia's current approaches to attaining land tenure security	229
9.5	Policy suggestions	230
9.5.1	Toward a rights-based approach	230
9.5.2	Legal and institutional reforms	232
9.5.3	Legal empowerment	239
9.6	Contribution to policy theory	239
9.7	Suggestions for further research	241
	APPENDIX I	243
	APPENDIX II	244
	APPENDIX III	245
	REFERENCES	247
	SAMENVATTING Dutch summary	257
	RINGKASAN Indonesian Summary	269
	CURRICULUM VITAE	281

List of maps, tables, and appendices

MAPS

Map 1	Bandung Municipality with survey locations indicated	24
-------	--	----

TABLES

Table 4.1	Semi-formal landholders: why do you not have a land certificate?	98
Table 4.2	Output sporadic registration in Bandung Municipality	99
Table 4.3	Output LAP in Bandung Municipality	100
Table 4.4	Possession of building permit per land tenure category	108
Table 4.5	Why do you not have a building permit?	109
Table 4.6	Number of building permits issued by Bandung's Municipal Building Service	109
Table 4.7	Estimation on derivative registration in case of future land transfers	110
Table 5.1	Selected overview of revenues of Bandung's municipal government	147
Table 5.2	Overview of expenditure of Bandung's Municipal Council and Secretariat	148
Table 5.3	Overview of expenditure of Bandung's municipal government on civil society organisations	151
Table 8.1	Do the authorities agree that you reside on this land?	216
Table 8.2	Why do you believe the authorities agree with you residing on this land?	216
Table 8.3	Is there a possibility of involuntary removal within the next 5 years?	217
Table 8.4	In case of involuntary removal, would you receive the compensation entitled to according to law?	217
Table 8.5	How has the possibility of involuntary removal changed since end of New Order?	218
Table 8.6	How has the possibility to receive proper compensation changed since end of the New Order?	218
Table 8.7	Household income and housing consolidation	219
Table 8.8	Regression of tenure category, perceived possibility of involuntary removal, household income on housing consolidation	220

APPENDICES

Appendix I	Autonomous Villages in Bandung Municipality 1906-1942	243
Appendix II	Socio-Economic Characteristics of Kampongs in Bandung Municipality	244
Appendix III	Physical Characteristics of Kampongs in Bandung Municipality	245

Acknowledgements

This book could not have been written without the help of numerous people. Space constraints mean I am unable to name everyone I would wish to; but to all I owe much gratitude. Some deserve particular mentioning and acknowledgment.

First of all, I would like to thank the residents of Gang Bongkaran, Taman Sari, and Pulo Undrus, Cibangkong, for welcoming me into their community and accepting me as one of them. I am particularly grateful to Yedi and Pak Cucu, who introduced me to Taman Sari and provided me with invaluable information. In Cibangkong, Pak Andar, Kang Maman, Kang Budi, Pak Agus, and the members of Radio Suara Cibangkong assisted me with my research and made my stay most pleasant. *Hatur nuhun!*

I also would like to thank my interviewees – activists, journalists, neighbourhood heads, officials, politicians, bureaucrats, and other stakeholders – as well as the 420 survey respondents who took the time to answer my questions.

Words of thanks also go to those who assisted me with the fieldwork: Denny Riezki Pratama and Anindya Praharsacitta, who helped me with the oral history research in Taman Sari; Dede Tresna Wiyanti, Ade Sudrajat, Yadi Suryadi, Ivan Rahadian, Deni Kurniawan, and Helmi Suryanegara for conducting the survey research; and Ira (Cecep) and Kang Dayat, who joined me during the interviews and whose knowledge of Bandung and of Sundanese (political and bureaucratic) culture proved indispensable.

While in Bandung, I was a visiting researcher at the Faculty of Law at the Parahyangan Catholic University. I am indebted to former dean Ismadi Bektı and staff for their hospitality, as well as the excellent research environment they provided. During my stay in Indonesia, I also had inspiring discussions with and was assisted by fellow academics, including Prof. Boedi Harsono, Novina Indiraharti, Inn Untari, and Selly Riawanti. Other people I would like to mention are Dianto Bachriadi, Hilma Safitri, Vinondini Indriati, Taufan Suranto and Bernadinus Steni. *Terima kasih banyak.*

In the Netherlands, I participated in periodic discussions with the Kota Group and the Klub van Leidse Urbanisten. I would like to thank the members of these groups and in particular Freek Colombijn, Prof. Peter Nas, Pauline van Roosmalen and Hans Versnel for providing valuable insights and comments.

Much gratitude I owe to Bec Donaldson for her excellent editing work and, perhaps more importantly, her patience. The project took much longer than planned, but Bec never complained.

I am indebted to my 'promotor' and 'co-promotor', Prof. Jan Michiel Otto and Adriaan Bedner, for involving me in the INDIRA-project and for providing invaluable advice and guidance throughout all the years. Words of thanks also to the other members of the INDIRA team: Prof. Takdir Rahmadi, Jamie Davidson, Daniel Fitzpatrick, Karen Portier, Herman Slaats, Marjanne Termorshuizen, Jacqueline Vel, Laurens Bakker and his wife Judith Zuidgeest, Saldi Isra, Sandra Moniaga and her husband Martua Sirait, Tristam Moeliono and his wife Widati Wulandari, Myrna Safitri, the late Djaka Soehendera, Sulastriono, Kurnia Warman, and supporting staff Carien Hietkamp and Theodora de Vries. And thanks to Prof. Soetandyo Wignjosoebroto. You were all a great source of inspiration.

Thanks also to my colleagues and friends at the VVI, including Julia Arnscheidt, the late Willem Assies, Stijn van Huis, Hilde Bos-Ollerman, Ab Massier, Ineke van der Meene, Benjamin van Rooij, Ken Setiawan, Rikardo Simarmata, Surya Tjandra, Janine Ubink, Theo Veenkamp, and Herlambang Wiratraman for sharing their knowledge, experience, and intellect; Jan van Olden for his remarkable organisational assistance; the late Albert Dekker and Sylvia Holverda, for providing indispensable literature; and Marianne Moria, Kari van Weeren, and Kora Bentvelsen for secretarial support. It was great working with you.

Special thanks to my friends Adrian Venema and Herlien Boediono, for their overwhelming generosity and care; Ibu Soedjatmo and family and equally the Moeliono family for their warm hospitality; my *Gangus* and *Omerta* friends, especially Gijs ter Braak, Jos Hectors, Coen Kievit, Jurjen Tuinman, and Ole Wittich, for showing a sincere interest in – and tolerance for! – my passion for Indonesia in general and in this research in particular; Wout Cornelissen, Arlo Griffiths, and Roy Voragen, for providing intellectual spirit and comradeship; Jean-Louis van Gelder for the previous, and for assisting me with the analysis of my statistical data and for giving valuable input on drafts of various chapters of this book.

My greatest debt is to my family. First of all, I would like to thank my uncle Jim Lopulalan, who through his stories about Indonesia sparked my passion for the country at an early age. Thanks Nuki and family in Indonesia, Susan and family in the Netherlands, Nils, Sabina, Koen, Annabel for your love and support. Mum, dad, in addition, thank you for your continuous faith in me. I couldn't have done this without you. Finally, "my biggest research finding", Nad: without this book we probably would not have been together. Equally, this book has separated us more than once. I know you are just as glad as I am that the job is finally done. Thanks for staying on my side throughout the course of this long project. I hope you are ready for our next.

Abbreviations and Acronyms

ADB	Asia Development Bank
AMS	<i>Angkatan Muda Siliwangi</i> , Siliwangi Youth Force
AusAID	Australian Agency for International Development
BAPPENAS	<i>Badan Perencanaan Pembangunan Nasional</i> , National Development Planning Agency
BAL	Basic Agrarian Law
BPK	<i>Badan Pemeriksa Keuangan</i> , Supreme Audit Board
BIGS	Bandung Institute of Governance Studies
BPN	<i>Badan Pertanahan Nasional</i> , National Land Agency
CESCR	UN Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
DPD	<i>Dewan Perwakilan Daerah</i> , Representative Council of the Regions
DPKLTS	<i>Dewan Pemerhati Kehutanan dan Lingkungan Tatar Sunda</i> , Monitoring Body for the Upgrading of Sundanese Forestry and Environment
DPR	<i>Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat</i> , People's Representative Council (National Parliament)
DPRD	<i>Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat Daerah</i> , Provincial Assembly / District/Municipal Council
FKPKP	<i>Forum Komunikasi Peduli Korban Pasupati</i> , Communication Forum for those Concerned with the Victims of Pasupati
Fordamasta	<i>Forum Masyarakat Kelurahan Taman Sari</i> , Public Forum of City Quarter Taman Sari
GASIBU	<i>Gabungan Anak Siliwangi Barisan Utama</i> , Grouping of Sons of Siliwangi Elite Troops
GIBAS	<i>Gabungan Inisiatif Barisan Anak Siliwangi</i> , Joint Initiative of the Sons of Siliwangi
Golkar	<i>Golongan karya</i> , Party of functional groups
GPI	<i>Gerakan Pemuda Islam</i> , Islamic Youth Movement
GR	Government Regulation
GTZ	' <i>Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit</i> ', German Society for Technical Cooperation
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
IMF	International Monetary Fund
Inpres	<i>Instruksi Presiden</i> , Presidential Instruction
ITB	<i>Institut Teknologi Bandung</i> , Bandung Institute of Technology
J4P	World Bank-sponsored Justice for the Poor programme

Keppres	<i>Keputusan presiden</i> , presidential decision (until 2004)
KIP	Kampung Improvement Project
KKN	<i>Korupsi, kolusi dan nepotisme</i> , generally applied acronym to refer to corruption, collusion, and nepotism
KMBB	<i>Koalisi Masyarakat Bandung Bermartabat</i> , 'Bandung Bermartabat' People's Coalition
KPA	<i>Konsortium Pembaruan Agraria</i> , Consortium for Agrarian Renewal
KSU Amanah	<i>Kooperasi Serba Usaha Amanah</i> , Business Cooperation Amanah
LAP	Land Administration Project
LBH	<i>Lembaga Bantuan Hukum</i> , Legal Aid Institute
LEAD	UNDP-sponsored Legal Empowerment and Assistance for the Disadvantaged programme
LIS	Land Information System
LMPDP	Land Management and Policy Development Project
M2PT	<i>Majelis Musyawarah Pembangunan Kelurahan Taman Sari</i> , Discussion Assembly for the Development of City Quarter Taman Sari
MA	<i>Mahkamah Agung</i> , Supreme Court
MCLE	Mediation and Community Legal Empowerment Program
MPR	<i>Majelis Permusyawaratan Rakyat</i> , People's Consultative Assembly, consisting of Representative Council of the Regions and People's Representative Council
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
NLA	National Land Agency
PAN	<i>Partai Amanat Nasional</i> , National Awakening Party
Pasupati	<i>(Jalan layang) Pasteur Surapati</i> , flyover in Bandung
PD	<i>Partai Demokrat</i> , Democratic Party
PDI-P	<i>Partai Demokrat Indonesia – Perjuangan</i> , Indonesian Democratic Party of Struggle
Perda	<i>Peraturan daerah</i> , regional regulation / bylaw
Permen	<i>Peraturan menteri</i> , ministerial regulation
Permendagri	<i>Peraturan menteri dalam negeri</i> , regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs
Perpres	<i>Peraturan presiden</i> , presidential regulation (from 2004)
PKB	<i>Partai Kebangkitan Bangsa</i> , National Awakening Party
PKBB	<i>Partai Keadilan Bulan Bintang</i> , Justice Moon and Star Party
PKI	<i>Partai Komunis Indonesia</i> , Indonesian Communist Party
PKS	<i>Partai Keadilan Sejahtera</i> , Justice and Prosperity Party
PNPM (Mandiri)	<i>Program Nasional Pemberdayaan Masyarakat</i> , National Community Empowerment Programme
POLRI	<i>Polisi Republik Indonesia</i> , Indonesian National Police

PP	<i>Peraturan Pemerintah</i> , Government Regulation / <i>Pemuda Pancasila</i> , Pancasila Youngsters
PPAN	<i>Program Pembaruan Agraria Nasional</i> , National Agrarian Renewal Programme
PPP	<i>Partai Persatuan Pembangunan</i> , United Development Party; Public-Private Partnership
PRODA	<i>Proyek Operasi Daerah Agraria</i> , Regional Land Registration Project
PRONA	<i>Proyek Operasi Nasional Agraria</i> , National Land Registration Project
PT KAI	<i>PT Kereta Api Indonesia</i> , Indonesian Railway Company
RALs	Regional Autonomy Laws (1999 and 2004)
REPELITA	<i>Rencana Pembangunan Lima Tahun</i> , Five-Year Development Plan (designed during the New Order)
Sawarung	<i>Sarasehan Warga Bandung</i> , a Bandung citizens' forum
SML	Spatial Management Law (1992 and 2007)
SSN	Social Safety Net
TAP MPR	<i>Ketetapan Majelis Permusyawaratan Rakyat</i> , People's Consultative Assembly Directive
TNI	<i>Tentara Nasional Indonesia</i> , Indonesian National Armed Forces
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UN-HABITAT	United Nations Human Settlements Programme
UNISBA	<i>Universitas Islam Bandung</i> , Islamic University of Bandung
UPC	Urban Poor Consortium
UPP	Urban Poverty Project
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
UUPA	<i>Undang-Undang Pokok-Pokok Agraria</i> , Basic Agrarian Law (BAL)
WALHI	<i>Wahana Lingkungan Hidup Indonesia</i> , Indonesian Environmental Forum

