

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/43731> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation.

Author: Bekele, M.S.

Title: Economic and agricultural transformation through large-scale farming : impacts of large-scale farming on local economic development, household food security and the environment in Ethiopia

Issue Date: 2016-10-25

Economic and Agricultural Transformation through Large-scale Farming

*Impacts of large-scale farming on local economic development,
household food security and the environment in Ethiopia*

MARU SHETE BEKELE

OCTOBER 2016

LEIDEN UNIVERSITY

THE NETHERLANDS

**Economic and Agricultural Transformation
through Large-scale Farming.**
*Impacts of large-scale farming on local economic
development, household food security and the
environment in Ethiopia*

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op dinsdag 25 oktober 2016
klokke 16:15 uur

door

Maru Shete Bekele

geboren te Bahir Dar in 1975

Promotores: Prof. dr. A.J. Dietz
Prof. dr. E.B. Zoomers (Universiteit Utrecht)
Dr. M.M.E.M. Rutten

Promotiecommissie: Prof. dr. G.A. Persoon
Prof. dr. T.A. Benjaminsen (Norwegian University of
Life Sciences)
Dr. M Dekker
Dr. T. Lavers (University of Geneva)

Table of Contents

List of Tables.....	i
List of Figures.....	iv
List of Boxes.....	iv
Abbreviations.....	v
Acknowledgements.....	viii
Dedication.....	ix
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION.....	1
1.1 Positioning Large-scale Farming in the Current Debate.....	1
1.2 The Research Problem.....	2
1.3 Context and Case Study Overview.....	9
1.4 Research Approach.....	18
1.5 Conceptual Framework.....	19
1.6 Research Design.....	23
1.7 Variables and Data Collection Methods.....	24
1.7.1 Variables and data sources.....	24
1.7.2 Sampling and data collection methods.....	25
1.8 Data Analyses Methods.....	32
1.8.1 Qualitative data analysis method.....	32
1.8.2 Quantitative data analysis method.....	32
1.9 Introducing the Chapters of the Dissertation.....	38
CHAPTER 2: AGRICULTURE AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IN AFRICA.....	41
2.1 Introduction.....	41
2.2 The Role of Agricultural Development in Economic Transformation.....	42
2.3 Economic and Agricultural Transformation through Large-scale Farming.....	45
2.3.1. The political economy argument of farm size.....	45
2.3.2. History and experience of large-scale farming in Africa.....	46
2.4 Contextualizing Large-scale Farming in the Historical Political Economy of Ethiopia.....	49
2.4.1 Introduction.....	49
2.4.2 State Formation and Ethiopia’s Political Economy during pre-Haile Selassie Period (1855–1930).....	49
2.4.3 Ethiopia’s Political Economy during the last Empire (1930–1974).....	50
2.4.4 Ethiopia’s Political Economy during the First Republic (1974–1991).....	55

2.4.5 The Political Economy of Contemporary Ethiopia (1991– present).....	58
CHAPTER 3: LARGE-SCALE FARMING AND LOCAL ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT IN ETHIOPIA.....	69
3.1 Introduction.....	69
3.2 The Research Gap.....	70
3.3 Methods.....	71
3.4 Results and Discussion.....	74
3.4.1 Overall returns of large-scale farming to economic development.....	74
3.4.2 Expectations and actual experiences of government key informants from large-scale farming in Ethiopia.....	84
3.4.3 Expectations and experiences of local people from large-scale farming in Ethiopia.....	92
CHAPTER 4: CONTRIBUTIONS OF LARGE-SCALE FARMING TO EMPLOYMENT AND INCOMES OF HOUSEHOLDS.....	105
4.1 Introduction.....	105
4.2 Results and Discussion.....	107
4.2.1 Contributions of large-scale farming to employment generation in Ethiopia.....	107
4.2.2 Impact of large-scale farming on income levels of local people.....	128
4.3 Conclusion.....	129
CHAPTER 5: IMPACTS OF LARGE-SCALE FARMING ON HOUSEHOLD FOOD SECURITY.....	129
5.1 Introduction.....	130
5.2 Concepts of Food Security.....	133
5.3 Indicators and Measurement of Food Security.....	136
5.4 Results and Discussion.....	136
5.4.1 Evidence from Oromia Regional State: The case of Karuturi Farm in Bako.....	136
5.4.1.1 <i>Estimation of magnitude and impact of Karuturi's intervention on households' food security using the 2012 cross-sectional household survey data.....</i>	142
5.4.1.2 <i>Estimation of magnitude and impact of Karuturi's intervention on households' food security using the 2012 and 2014 household survey data.....</i>	147
5.4.2 Evidence from Gambella Regional State: The case of Basen Farm.....	151
5.4.3 Evidence from Gambella Regional State: The case of Karuturi Farm.....	159
5.4.4 Evidence from Benshanguel Gumuz Regional State: The case of S&P Farm.....	164
5.5 Summary.....	165
CHAPTER 6: IMPACTS OF LARGE-SCALE FARMING ON LOCAL ENVIRONMENT.....	165
6.1 Introduction.....	165
6.2 Results.....	173

6.2.1	Vegetation cover change induced by large-scale farms in Ethiopia.....	173
6.2.2	Impact of large-scale farms on soil compaction.....	178
6.2.3	Impact of large-scale farms on soil micro-nutrients.....	181
6.2.4	Farmers' perception on the environmental effects of large-scale farming.....	185
6.3	Discussion.....	189
6.3.1	Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) and large-scale farms in Ethiopia.....	189
6.3.2	Implications of the loss of soil organic carbon.....	191
6.3.3	The challenges of soil compaction.....	193
6.3.4	Soil micro-nutrient decline and the sustainability challenge.....	194
6.4	Conclusion.....	196
CHAPTER 7: SUMMARY, CONCLUSION AND POLICY IMPLICATIONS.....		197
7.1	Summary.....	197
7.2	Comparing Impacts of the Large-scale Farm Cases.....	201
7.2.1	Comparison based on geographical location of the large-scale farms.....	202
7.2.2	Comparison based on type of crop commodity cultivated by large-scale farms.....	204
7.3	Factors Determining Performance of Large-scale Farms.....	205
7.3.1	Capacity and farming experience of the investor.....	205
7.3.2	Problems related to infrastructure, labour availability and markets.....	208
7.3.3	Institutional and land governance related factors.....	209
7.3.4	Socio-economic and natural context.....	213
7.3.5	Misconceptions about large-scale land acquisition.....	214
7.4	Conclusion.....	216
7.4.1	Implications for Ethiopia's political economy.....	218
7.4.2	Implications for the governance of large-scale farming in Ethiopia.....	220
7.4.3	Implications for the Land Acquisition Debate.....	222
References.....		224
Annexes.....		248
Summary/ Samenvatting.....		269
Curriculum Vitae.....		272

List of Tables

Table 1.1:	Description of case studies (Large-scale farms).....	16
Table 2.1:	Estimates of land size transfer in Ethiopia.....	65
Table 2.2:	Farmland acquired by private investors in Ethiopia (1992–2013).....	67
Table 3.1:	Loans provided to large-scale farms by commercial banks in Ethiopia (2008–2013).....	75
Table 3.2:	Mean annual discounted economic benefit to local and national economy, the case of Karuturi’s investment in Oromia Regional State, Ethiopia.....	77
Table 3.3:	Mean annual discounted economic benefit to local and national economy, the case of Basen Farm in Gambella Regional State.....	80
Table 3.4:	Mean annual discounted economic benefit to local and national economy, the case of S&P Farm in Benshanguel Gumuz Regional State.....	83
Table 3.5:	Perceived expectations and actual experiences of key government informants from large-scale farming in Ethiopia (n=42).....	87
Table 3.6:	Disaggregated analysis of key government informants’ perceived expectation and actual experiences from large-scale farming in Ethiopia (n=42).....	91
Table 3.7:	Perceived expectations and experiences of land users from large-scale farms in Ethiopia.....	95
Table 4.1:	Employment generation from large-scale farms in Ethiopia.....	107
Table 4.2:	Determinants of wage rates in large-scale farms in Ethiopia.....	111
Table 4.3:	Difference-in-difference estimation of the impact of Karuturi Farm on household annual gross income (ETB) in Bako Tibe District, Oromia Regional State.....	118
Table 4.4:	PSM estimation of the impact of Karuturi's intervention on household income and livestock ownership in Bako Tibe District, Oromia Regional State.....	119
Table 4.5:	DiD estimation of the impact of Karuturi Farm on household livestock ownership (TLU) in Bako Tibe District, Oromia Regional State.....	120
Table 4.6:	Distribution of livestock holdings and composition between affected and non- affected households.....	121
Table 4.7:	Impact of Karuturi's intervention on household gross income (ETB) in Gambella Regional State.....	123

Table 4.8:	Impact of Basen’s intervention on household gross income (ETB) in Gambella Regional State.....	124
Table 4.9:	Difference-in-difference estimation of the impact of S&P Farm on household annual gross income (ETB) in Dangur District, Benshanguel Gumuz Regional State.....	127
Table 5.1:	Magnitude of food security in Bako Tibe District for affected and non-affected households.....	137
Table 5.2:	Impact of Karuturi’s investment on household food security in Bako Tibe District.....	139
Table 5.3:	Decomposition of affected households’ food insecurity after accounting for the estimated loss of consumption expenditure, n=142	140
Table 5.4:	Decomposition of affected households’ food insecurity after accounting for the estimated increase in CSI score, n=142	140
Table 5.5:	Decomposition of affected households’ food insecurity after accounting for the estimated loss of food energy consumed per adult equivalent per day (Kcal), n=142.....	141
Table 5.6:	Difference-in-difference estimation of the impact of large-scale farming on household food security in Bako District, Oromia Regional State.....	143
Table 5.7:	Magnitude of food security before (2012) and after Karuturi’s intervention (2014) in Bako Tibe District, Oromia Regional State.....	144
Table 5.8:	Decomposition of the food insecurity level of affected households after accounting for the impact of the intervention.....	145
Table 5.9:	Food security status of households affected by Basen Farm, Gambella Regional State.....	147
Table 5.10:	Impact of Basen Farm on household food security, Gambella Regional State.....	150
Table 5.11:	Food security status of households affected by Karuturi arm, Gambella.....	153
Table 5.12:	Impacts of Karuturi's intervention on the food security status of the Anuak and the Nuer, Gambella Regional State.....	154
Table 5.13:	Difference-in-Difference estimation of the impact of S&P Farm on household food security in Dangur District, Benshanguel Gumuz Regional State.....	160
Table 5.14:	Levels of food security before and after the intervention of S&P Company	

	in Dangur District, Benshanguel Gumuz Regional State.....	162
Table 6.1:	Patterns of dominant land-use changes due to large-scale farming in Ethiopia.....	169
Table 6.2:	Vegetation cover change induced by large-scale farms in Gambella and Benshanguel Gumuz regional states.....	173
Table 6.3:	Effects of land use change on soil bulk density and organic carbon in Oromia and Benshanguel Gumuz regional states.....	180
Table 6.4:	Effects of land use change on soil bulk density and organic carbon in Gambella Regional State.....	180
Table 6.5:	Effects of land use change on soil micronutrients in Oromia and Benshanguel Gumuz regional states.....	182
Table 6.6:	Effects of land-use change on soil micro-nutrients in Gambella Regional State, the case of Basen and Karuturi farms.....	184
Table 6.7:	Local people’s perception of the impacts of large-scale farms on socio-economic and environment variables in Oromia, Gambella and Benshanguel Gumuz regional states.....	187
Table 6.8:	Environmental impact assessment of major large-scale farms in Ethiopia.....	190

List of Figures

Figure 1.1:	Map of study regions and case studies.....	10
Figure 1.2:	Sketch of the farm landscape in Karuturi and the surrounding smallholder farms.....	12
Figure 1.3:	Conceptual framework (Source: Own construction).....	26
Figure 5.1:	Settlement pattern and large-scale farm development in Gambella regional state.....	148
Figure 6.1:	Conceptual framework for the dominant global land-use changes.....	167
Figure 6.2a:	Land use by Karuturi (Ilia site, Gambella) in 2008.....	174
Figure 6.2b:	Land use by Karuturi in 2015.....	174
Figure 6.3a:	Land use map of S&P Farm in 2009.....	176
Figure 6.3b:	Land use map of S&P Farm in 2015.....	176
Figure 6.4a:	Land use by Basen Farm in 2003.....	177
Figure 6.4b:	Land use by Basen Farm in 2015.....	177

List of Boxes

Box 1:	Life story of immigrant settlers in Abobo District, Gambella Regional State.....	125
Box 2:	Life story of a migrant labourer in Basen Farm, Abobo District, Gambella Regional State.....	126
Box 3:	Life story of an Anuak, Abobo District, Gambella Regional State.....	126

Abbreviations

ADLI:	Agricultural Development-Led Industrialization
AGRA:	Alliance for a Green Revolution in Africa
AILAA:	Agricultural Investment and Land Administration Agency
AISD:	Agricultural Investment Support Directorate
AMC:	Agricultural Marketing Corporation
ANRS:	Amhara National Regional State
ASC:	African Studies Centre
ATA:	Agricultural Transformation Agency
ATT:	Average Treatment Effect on the Treated
BD:	Soil Bulk Density
BGRS:	Benshanguel Gumuz Regional State
CAADP:	Comprehensive Africa Agriculture Development Programme
AU:	The African Union
CADU:	Chilalo Agricultural Development Unit
CFSVA:	Comprehensive Food Security and Vulnerability Analysis
CSA:	Central Statistical Authority
CSI:	Coping Strategy Index
CSR:	Corporate Social Responsibility
DFID:	United Kingdom Department for International Development
DiD:	Difference-in-Difference
EEA:	Ethiopian Economic Association
EEPCo:	Ethiopian Electric Power Corporation
EHNRI:	Ethiopian Health and Nutrition Research Institute
EIA:	Environmental Impact Assessment
EPA:	Environmental Protection Authority
EPRDF:	Ethiopian People’s Revolutionary Democratic Front
ETB:	Ethiopian Birr
FAD:	Food Production Decline
FAO:	Food and Agricultural Organization of the United Nations
FBS:	Food Balance Sheet
FDI:	Foreign Direct Investment
FDRE:	Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

FEI:	Food Energy Intake
FEWSN:	Famine Early Warning System Network
FGD:	Focus Group Discussion
FPIC:	Free, Prior and Informed Consent
FSS:	Food Security Strategy
GDP:	Gross Domestic Product
GFSI:	Global Food Security Index
GHG:	Green House Gas
GHI:	Global Hunger Index
GTP:	Growth and Transformation Plan
HABP:	Household Asset Building Programme
HCES:	Household Consumption and Expenditure Survey
HDDS:	Household Dietary Diversity Score
HFIAS:	Household Food Insecurity Access Scale
HoAREC:	Horn of Africa Regional Environment Centre
HoARECN:	Horn of Africa Regional Environmental Centre & Network
HRW:	Human Rights Watch
IDS:	Institute of Development Studies
IFAD:	International Fund for Agricultural Development
IFPRI:	International Food Policy Research Institution
IIED:	International Institute for Environment and Development
IPCC:	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
Kcal:	Kilo Calorie
LANDac:	The IS Academy on Land Governance for Equitable and Sustainable Development
LSLA:	Large Scale Land Acquisition
MDG:	Millennium Development Goals
MoA:	Ministry of Agriculture
MoARD:	Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development
MoFED:	Ministry of Finance and Economic Development
NEPAD:	The New Partnership for Africa's Development
NMSA:	National Meteorological Service Agency
NPV:	Net Present Value
NTFP:	Non-Timber Forest Products

OAU:	Organization for the African Union
OI:	Oakland Institute
ONRS:	Oromia National Regional State
PADEP:	Peasant Agricultural Development Extension Programme
PADTES:	Participatory Demonstration and Training Extension System
PASDEP:	Plan for Accelerated and Sustained Development to End Poverty
PLC:	Private Limited Company
PRAI:	Principles for Responsible Agricultural Investment
PRSP:	Poverty Reduction Strategy Programmes
PSM:	Propensity Score Matching
PSNP:	Productive Safety Net Programme
S&P:	Shampoorji and Pallonji
SEM:	Standard Error of Mean
SIDA:	Swedish International Development Agency
SLA:	Sustainable Livelihood Approach
SNNP:	Southern Nations, Nationalities and People's Region
SOC:	Soil Organic Carbon
SSA:	Sub-Saharan Africa
TGE:	Transitional Government of Ethiopia
TLU:	Tropical Livestock Unit
TNRS:	Tigray National Regional State
TPLF:	Tigray people's Liberation Front
WADU:	Wolaita Agricultural Development Unit

Acknowledgements

My quest for a doctoral study was met after I succeeded in acquiring a PhD position in 2011 with a financial grant from the IS Academy on Land Governance for Equitable and Sustainable Development (LANDac) and the African Studies Centre Leiden (ASCL), Leiden University. I thank the LANDac and the ASCL for enabling me to fulfill my dreams by covering the entire costs of my doctoral studies. In this regard, the Faculty of Geoscience at Utrecht University managed the finance during the project period and I duly thank Utrecht University. The ASCL, in addition to contributing half of the total budget for my study, provided me with a very nice study place and office facilities. I am very much indebted to the ASCL for the sponsorship and for the place to study, without which my dreams would not have come true.

Luckily enough, I had a very good mix of promoters who gave me much freedom in this study and they supported the idea of conducting long-term fieldwork to generate the necessary field data in three distinct research locations. Prof. Ton Dietz (Director, ASCL), Prof. Annelies Zoomers (Utrecht University) and Dr. Marcel Rutten (ASCL) deserve special acknowledgement. The close follow-up and assistance of Dr. Marcel Rutten through emails and telephone calls and our visit to the remote villages in the regional state of Gambella in Ethiopia is unforgettable and I thank you very much. During my visit to the Netherlands, the ASCL's Maaïke Westra played a vital role in arranging all practical matters such as accommodation, return flights, health insurance and an office desk. I am thankful to Maaïke Westra for her warm hospitality. Staff members of the Secretariat of the ASCL also deserve special thanks for their assistance in various ways.

Many individuals and institutions contributed a great deal during the process of data generation for this study. Dr. Eylachew Zewde was instrumental in terms of generating the needed and credible soil data, and enlightened me with another dimension of knowledge and skill. Thank you Dr. Eylachew! Special thanks go to Dereje Abebe, an expert at the Agricultural Investment and Land Administration Agency (AILAA) in Ethiopia, who linked me with the managers of the investment projects that have been part of my case studies. Thanks are also due to: the AILAA; the Ethiopian Investment Authority; Oromia, Gambella and Benshanguel Gumuz Regional States Investment Bureaus; Agricultural and Rural Development Offices of the three regional states; District Administrative Offices of the three regional states; Land Utilization & Environmental Protection Authority of the three regional states; and District Finance and Revenue Offices of the three regional states. Thanks are also due to my energetic enumerators who did a wonderful data collection job by accepting my demands to go to randomly chosen households, often located at great distances. Without the willingness of farmers and agro-pastoralists to provide information for the study, this research project would not have been successful. I thank you all for your generous supply of information and for your hospitality. Entering an enormous amount of data into a computer database is a crucial yet tedious part of the research process. My wife, Betanya Meresa, decided to take this responsibility and has done a meticulous job. Thank you Bity!

Dedicated to

Naomi Maru Shete. I miss you always!