



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The Nuremberg Military Tribunals and the origins of International Criminal Law

Heller, K.J.

Citation

Heller, K. J. (2011, June 16). *The Nuremberg Military Tribunals and the origins of International Criminal Law*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/17757>

Version: Not Applicable (or Unknown)

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/17757>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Detailed Table of Contents

Introduction.....1

Chapter 1: From the IMT to the Zonal Trials.....9

Introduction

I. JCS 1023/10

II. Law No. 10 and the Subsequent Proceedings Division

III. The Prospect of a Second International Trial

Chapter 2: The OCC and the Tribunals.....26

Introduction

I. Ordinance No. 7

II. The OCC

A. Structure

1. The Professional Segment

a. Military Division

b. Ministries Division

c. SS Division

d. Economics Division

e. Trial Teams

f. Evidence Division

g. Special Projects Division

2. The Service Segment

a. Administrative Division

b. Reproduction Division

c. Signal Division

d. Language Division

e. Publications Division

3. Public Information Office

4. Satellite Brances

B. Staffing

1. Prosecutors

2. Foreign Delegations

3. Female Prosecutors

4. Jews and Communists

C. Funding

III. The Military Tribunals

A. The Court

B. The Secretariat

C. The Tribunals

Chapter 3: The Evolution of the Trial Program.....43

Introduction

I. Principles of Selection

A. Early Planning

B. Selecting Defendants

1. Evidence

2. Analysis

C. Trial Groups

II. Creation of the Trial Program

A. The Initial Cases

1. The Medical Case (Case No. 1)

2. Milch (Case No. 2)

3. The Justice Case (Case No. 3)

4. Pohl (Case No. 4)

5. Flick (Case No. 5)

B. The March 14 Program

1. The Necessary Ten

- a. RuSHA
- b. Prisoner of War Case
- c. Field Commander Case
- d. Principal Military Case
- e. Farben
- f. Krupp
- g. Dresdner Bank
- h. Food and Agriculture/Hermann Goering Works
- i. Government Administration
- j. Foreign Office

2. The Optional Three

- a. SD-Gestapo-RSHA
- b. Warsaw Destruction
- c. Propaganda and Education

C. Cases 6 & 7

1. Farben (Case No. 6)
2. The Hostage Case (Case No. 7)

D. The May 20 Program

1. Cases Eliminated from the March 14 Program
2. Other Eliminated Cases
3. RuSHA
4. SD-Gestapo-RSHA
5. Prisoner of War Case
6. Principal Military Case
7. Krupp
8. Food and Agriculture-Hermann Goering Works
9. Foreign Office

E. Cases 8-10

1. RuSHA (Case No. 8)
2. Einsatzgruppen (Case No. 9)
3. Krupp (Case No. 10)
4. The Second Medical Case

F. The September 4 Program

1. Abandonment
2. Elimination
3. Contraction

F. Final Planning

G. Cases 11 & 12

1. Ministries (Case No. 11)
2. High Command (Case No. 12)

Chapter 4: The Trials.....82

Introduction

I. The Medical Case

- A. The Indictment
- B. The Tribunal
- C. Noteworthy Aspects
- D. Outcome

II. Milch

- A. The Indictment
- B. The Tribunal
- C. Outcome

III. The Justice Case

- A. The Indictment
- B. The Tribunal
- C. Outcome

IV. Pohl

A. The Indictment

B. The Tribunal

C. Outcome

V. Flick

A. The Indictment

B. The Tribunal

C. Outcome

VI. Farben

A. The Indictment

B. The Tribunal

C. Outcome

D. Noteworthy Aspects

VII. The Hostage Case

A. The Indictment

B. The Tribunal

C. Outcome

D. Noteworthy Aspects

VIII. RuSHA

A. The Indictment

B. The Tribunal

C. Outcome

IX. Einsatzgruppen

A. The Indictment

B. The Tribunal

C. Outcome

D. Noteworthy Aspects

X. Krupp

A. The Indictment

B. The Tribunal

- C. Outcome
- D. Noteworthy Aspects

XI. Ministries

- A. The Indictment
- B. The Tribunal
- C. Outcome
- D. Noteworthy Aspects

XII. High Command

- A. The Indictment
- B. The Tribunal
- C. Outcome
- D. Noteworthy Aspects

Chapter 5: Jurisdiction and Legal Character of the Tribunals.....101

Introduction

I. Subject-Matter Jurisdiction

- A. Crimes Against Peace
- B. War Crimes
- C. Crimes Against Humanity
- D. Criminal Membership
- E. Conspiracy
- F. Modes of Participation

II. The Character of the Tribunals

- A. What Makes a Tribunal International?
- B. Were the NMTs International Tribunals?
- C. Were the NMTs American Courts or Tribunals?
- D. The NMTs as Inter-Allied Special Tribunals
 - 1. Debellatio
 - 2. Condominium

3. Inter-Allied Special Tribunals

4. Why Not German Courts?

III. What Kind of Law Did the NMTs Apply?

A. The Law of Occupation

B. American Law

C. German Law

D. International Law

1. International Ratification

2. Pre-Existing International Law

IV. Retroactivity

A. Does the Principle of Non-Retroactivity Apply?

B. Did Law No. 10 Violate the Principle of Non-Retroactivity?

1. War Crimes

2. Crimes Against Peace

3. Crimes Against Humanity

4. Criminal Membership

V. Personal Jurisdiction

A. War Crimes

B. Crimes Against Peace

C. Crimes Against Humanity

Conclusion

Chapter 6: Evidence.....133

Introduction

I. Admissibility and the Standard of Proof

II. Testimonial Evidence

A. Witness Testimony

1. Rules Governing Witness Testimony

2. Calling Witnesses

3. Self-Incrimination
4. Questioning by Defendants
5. Scope of Examination

B. Taking Evidence Via Commissioners

C. Testimony by Defendants

III. Documentary Evidence

A. Affidavits, Depositions, Interrogations, and Other Statements

1. Statements in Lieu of Oath
2. Affidavits by Available Witnesses
3. Affidavits by Unavailable Witnesses
 - a. Living Affiants
 - b. Deceased Affiants
4. Probative Value of Non-Examined Witness Statements
5. Pre-Trial Statements by Defendants

B. Captured Documents

IV. Judicial Notice, Res Judicata, and Precedent

A. Judicial Notice

B. Res Judicata

C. Precedent

Conclusion

Chapter 7: Procedure.....149

Introduction

I. Fair Trial Rights

A. Indictment

B. Right to Counsel

1. German Attorneys
2. Non-German Attorneys

C. Self-Incrimination

1. Unwarned Statements

2. Duress

D. Production of Witnesses and Documents

1. Witnesses

2. Documents

II. Defense Resources

A. Time

B. Resources

1. Counsel and Staff

2. Material Resources

III. Appeal

Conclusion

Chapter 8: Crimes Against Peace.....168

Introduction

I. Aggressive Wars and Invasions

A. Aggressive Wars

B. Invasions

C. Self-Defense

II. Individual Criminal Responsibility

A. The Leadership Requirement

1. The Development of the Requirement

2. The Requirement Defined

3. The Effect of the Requirement

B. Actus Reus

1. Planning, Preparing, Initiating

a. Planning

b. Preparing

c. Initiating

2. Waging

C. Mens Rea

1. The Definition of Knowledge
2. The Mens Rea of Rearmament
3. The Effect of the Mens Rea Requirement

III. Common Plan or Conspiracy

Conclusion

Chapter 9: War Crimes.....191

Introduction

I. The Application of the Laws and Customs of War

A. The General Applicability of the Conventions

B. The Specific Applicability of the Conventions

1. Actual Conflict
2. Belligerent Occupation
3. Jus ad Bellum vs. Jus in Bello
4. Reciprocity

II. Summary Execution of Lawful Combatants

A. Lawful Combatants

B. Summary Execution

III. Crimes Against Prisoners of War

A. The Use of POWs in the War Effort

B. Mistreatment of POWs

1. Inhumane and Dangerous Conditions
 - a. Inhumane Conditions
 - b. Dangerous Conditions
2. Unfair Trials

IV. Crimes Against Civilians

A. Hostage-Taking and Reprisals

1. Hostages	
2. Reprisal Prisoners	
3. Fixed Ratios	
4. Status Under Customary International Law	
B. Use in the War Effort	
1. Conscription	
2. Military Operations	
C. Deportation	
D. Slave Labor	
E. Mistreatment of Civilians	
1. Inhumane Labor Conditions	
2. Medical Experimentation	
3. Denial of Rights	
i. Right to a Fair Trial	
ii. Right to Property	
iii. Right to Nationality	
iv. Right to Religion	
V. Crimes Against Property	
A. Private Property	
B. Public Property	
Conclusion	
Chapter 10: Crimes Against Humanity.....	218
Introduction	
I. Acts in Occupied Territory	
II. Wartime Acts Outside of Occupied Territory	
A. Non-German Civilians	
B. German Civilians	
III. Acts Committed Before the War	

- A. Background
- B. The Tribunals' Response
 - 1. No Nexus Required
 - 2. Nexus Required
 - 3. Ministries
 - a. The Defense Argument
 - b. The Prosecution Argument
 - c. The Tribunal's Decision

IV. The Contextual Elements

- A. Government Policy
- B. Large-Scale and Systematic Acts
- C. Connection Between the Act and the Attack

V. Substantive Law

- A. Murder-Type
- B. Persecution Type
 - 1. Persecution as a War Crime
 - 2. Minor Forms of Persecution
 - 3. Deprivation of Property
 - a. Industrial Property
 - b. Personal Property
- C. Genocide

Conclusion

Chapter 11: Modes of Participation.....238

Introduction

I. General Principles

- A. Basic Structure of Criminal Responsibility
- B. Corporate Criminal Responsibility
- C. Principals and Accessories

II. Ordering

A. Illegal Order

B. Actus Reus

1. Military Orders

a. Issuing

b. Drafting

c. Transmitting

2. Civilian Orders

C. Mens Rea

D. A Substantive Crime?

III. Consenting Part

A. Knowledge

B. Authority

C. Failure to Object

IV. Command Responsibility

A. Superior/Subordinate Relationship

1. Military Superiors

a. Commanding Generals

b. Tactical Commanders

c. Chiefs of Staff

2. Civilian Superiors

B. Mens Rea

1. Knowledge

2. Negligence

3. High Command

C. Efforts to Prevent or Punish

1. Failure to Prevent

2. Failure to Prevent Recurrence

3. Failure to Punish

D. Causation

E. Independent Crime or Complicity?

V. Other Modes

A. Incitement

B. Perpetration by Means

C. Attempt

Conclusion

Chapter 12: Conspiracy, Enterprise Liability, and Criminal Membership.....259

Introduction

I. Conspiracy to Commit War Crimes and Crimes Against Humanity

A. The Defense Argument

B. The Prosecution Argument

C. The Outcome

D. The OCC's Response

II. Enterprise Liability

A. The Criminal Enterprise

1. Nature

2. Horizontal and Vertical Enterprises

B. Commission of a Crime

C. Mens Rea

D. Actus Reus

1. Creators

2. Executors

a. Action

b Authority and Discretion

E. "Abetting" a Criminal Enterprise

F. The Responsibility of Private Economic Actors

G. The Responsibility of Legal Advisors

III. Criminal Membership

A. The Nature of the Crime

B. Elements of the Crime

1. Membership

2. Voluntariness

3. Knowledge

Conclusion

Chapter 13: Defenses.....278

Introduction

I. Jurisdictional Defenses

A. Immunity

B. Selective Prosecution

C. Tu Quoque

II. Substantive Defenses

A. Burden of Proof

B. Superior Orders

1. Source

2. Scope and Effect

3. Conditional Liability

C. Necessity

D. Self-Defense

E. Mistake of Law

III. Military Necessity

Conclusion

Chapter 14: Sentencing.....293

Introduction

I. General Principles

II. Within-Case Comparisons

- A. The Medical Case
- B. Justice
- C. Pohl
- D. Flick
- E. The Hostage Case
- F. Farben
- G. Einsatzgruppen
- H. RuSHA
- I. Krupp
- J. Ministries
- K. High Command

III. Aggravating Factors

IV. Mitigating Factors

- A. Justifications
 - 1. Independence
 - 2. Resistance
- B. Excuses
 - 1. Superior Orders
 - 2. Military Considerations
 - 3. Legal Clarity
 - 4. Personal Characteristics

V. Between-Case Comparisons

- A. Are Comparisons Possible?
- B. Did the Sentences Become More Lenient?

Conclusion

Chapter 15: Aftermath.....311

Introduction

- I. Events Preceding McCloy’s Appointment as High Commissioner
 - A. General Clay’s Review
 - B. Attacks on the War Crimes Program
 - C. The Simpson Committee
 - D. Landsberg Prison and the Baldwin Commission
 - E. The Ministries Dissent
 - F. The Deactivation of the OCC
- II. John J. McCloy and the Advisory Board on War Criminals
 - A. McCloy’s Appointment
 - B. Creation of the War Crimes Modification Board
 - C. McCloy’s Advisory Board on War Criminals
 - D. The Work of the Advisory Board
 - E. The Advisory Board’s Recommendations
 - F. McCloy’s Clemency Decisions
 - G. Were the Good Conduct and Clemency Programs Ultra Vires?
 - 1. Ordinance No. 7
 - 2. The High Commission
 - H. The Response to the Decisions
- III. The Clemency Boards
 - A. The Interim Mixed Parole and Clemency Board
 - B. The Mixed Parole and Clemency Board

Chapter 16: Legacy.....347

Introduction

I. Retribution

- A. Selectivity
- B. Convicting the Innocent
- C. Acquitting the Guilty
- D. Just Punishment

II. The Documentary and Didactic Functions

III. The Origins of International Criminal Law

A. Customary International Law

B. The Principle of Non-Retroactivity

C. Evidence and Procedure

D. Aggression

E. War Crimes

1. Lawful Combatants

2. Hostage-Taking and Reprisals

3. Individual Crimes

F. Crimes Against Humanity

1. The Nexus Requirement

2. Contextual Elements

a. Widespread or Systematic

b. The Policy Requirement

3. Individual Crimes

a. Extermination

b. Enslavement

c. Deportation

d. Imprisonment

e. Torture and Rape

f. Persecution

G. Genocide

H. Conspiracy and Criminal Membership

I. Modes of Participation

1. Ordering

2. Joint Criminal Enterprise

3. Aiding and Abetting

4. Command Responsibility

a. Superior/Subordinate Relationship

b. Mens Rea

c. Failure to Prevent or Punish

5. Taking a Consenting Part

J. Defenses

1. Tu Quoque

2. Necessity/Duress

3. Military Necessity

K. Sentencing

Conclusion.....373

Bibliography.....376