



Universiteit
Leiden
The Netherlands

The vigilance of individuals : how, when and why the EU legislates to facilitate the private enforcement of EU law before national courts

Wilman, F.G.

Citation

Wilman, F. G. (2014, December 18). *The vigilance of individuals : how, when and why the EU legislates to facilitate the private enforcement of EU law before national courts. Meijers-reeks*. Retrieved from <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/30219>

Version: Corrected Publisher's Version

License: [Licence agreement concerning inclusion of doctoral thesis in the Institutional Repository of the University of Leiden](#)

Downloaded from: <https://hdl.handle.net/1887/30219>

Note: To cite this publication please use the final published version (if applicable).

Cover Page



Universiteit Leiden



The handle <http://hdl.handle.net/1887/30219> holds various files of this Leiden University dissertation

Author: Wilman, F.G.

Title: The vigilance of individuals : how, when and why the EU legislates to facilitate the private enforcement of EU law before national courts

Issue Date: 2014-12-18

The vigilance of individuals

How, when and why the EU legislates to facilitate the private enforcement
of EU law before national courts

The vigilance of individuals

*How, when and why the EU legislates to facilitate
the private enforcement of EU law before national
courts*

PROEFSCHRIFT

ter verkrijging van
de graad van Doctor aan de Universiteit Leiden,
op gezag van Rector Magnificus prof. mr. C.J.J.M. Stolker,
volgens besluit van het College voor Promoties
te verdedigen op donderdag 18 december 2014
klokke 15.00 uur

door

Folkert Geert Wilman

geboren te Damwoude

in 1978

Promotiecommissie:

Promotores: prof. mr. H.J. Snijders
 prof. mr. S.C.G. Van den Bogaert

Overige leden: prof. J. Cartwright (University of Oxford, UK;
 Universiteit Leiden)
 prof. M. Dougan (University of Liverpool, UK)
 prof. mr. J.M. Hebly
 prof. mr. H.B. Krans (Rijksuniversiteit Groningen)
 prof. mr. T.R. Ottervanger
 prof. mr. D.J.G. Visser

Lay-out: AlphaZet prepress, Waddinxveen
Printwerk: Wöhrmann Prints-service

© 2014 F.G. Wilman

Behoudens de in of krachtens de Auteurswet van 1912 gestelde uitzonderingen mag niets uit deze uitgave worden vervoelvoudigd, opgeslagen in een geautomatiseerd gegevensbestand of openbaar gemaakt, in enige vorm of op enige wijze, hetzij elektronisch, mechanisch, door fotokopieën, opnamen of enige andere manier, zonder voorafgaande schriftelijke toestemming van de uitgever.

Het reprorecht wordt niet uitgeoefend.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, made available or communicated to the public, in any form or by any means, without the prior permission in writing of the publisher, unless this is expressly permitted by law.

Acknowledgments

While this book might seem a tribute to the vigilance of individuals, writing it has made it clear to me once more that an individual – or at least the present author – can only achieve anything of substance (if completing a PhD thesis may count as such) if he can rely on the support of those surrounding him. There are therefore many persons I wish to thank here.

To begin with, I thank the University of Leiden and in particular of course Henk and Stefaan, my two thesis supervisors. I hugely benefitted not only from their individual expertise, but also from the environment that they created in which we could have such interesting and enjoyable discussions on the wide variety of issues that came up in the process of writing my thesis. I am also grateful to the members of the *promotiecommissie*, for not having been discouraged by the sheer length of the work and for their valuable feed-back on it, as well as to the E.M. Meijers Instituut for its support. Special thanks in this regard go to Jan-Michiël, as he stood both at the end and at the very beginning of this academic journey. In addition I wish to thank many of my colleagues at the Legal Service of the European Commission. While I carried out this work on a purely personal basis, over the past years they provided me, knowingly or unknowingly, with the ideas, challenges and encouragement that somehow naturally seem to emerge when working in an inspiring multinational legal environment.

Turning to the home front, I am grateful to my friends, as much for their interest in my academic work as for the valuable distractions from that work that they offered me on many occasions. Indeed, a PhD thesis should know its place, and that is well behind beers and bicycle racing. It goes without saying that I also cannot thank enough my family, both on the Frisian and the Spanish side, for their continuous love and interest. That goes of course most of all for my parents. Last but not least, I wish to mention my wife Gloria and our children Iker and Nynke. One of their main contributions to this book has been to have twice set me something far more valuable than a deadline, namely a ‘lifeline’, i.e. a due date. Although I did not manage to meet either of them, I certainly tried (and found that the maternity ward is a great place to read the Common Market Law Review). Iker further deserves special mention for teaching me that sleep is a relative and overrated concept. As to Nynke, not only a Ph.D thesis, but even beers and bicycle racing can only come second to such a beautiful baby. Yet most of all my thanks go to Gloria. Over the past years she managed to strike the perfect balance between providing practical as well as intellectual support on the one hand and a healthy degree of relativism on the other hand. Without her vigilance in all these respects I could not have written this book. It is therefore to her that I dedicate it.

Brussels, 8 November 2014

All views expressed in this document are strictly personal and cannot be ascribed to the European Commission.

Summary of Contents

A.	INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND	1
1.	Introduction	3
2.	Key principles, public enforcement and case law	29
B.	SELECTED EU LEGISLATION	71
3.	Public procurement law	73
4.	Intellectual property law	115
5.	Consumer protection law	157
6.	Competition law	205
C.	COMPARISON AND CONTEXTUALISATION: REMEDIES AND PROCEDURES	265
7.	Actions for damages and actions for injunctions	267
8.	Contractual and other remedies	317
9.	Procedural provisions and other issues	367
D.	BROADER ASPECTS, PERSPECTIVES AND CONCLUSIONS	407
10.	The how, when and why of EU private enforcement legislation	409
11.	Two perspectives on private enforcement	467
12.	Summary and conclusions	519

Table of Contents

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	V
SUMMARY OF CONTENTS	VII
A. INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND	1
1. INTRODUCTION	3
1.1. The vigilance of individuals: context	3
1.1.1. The creation of a private enforcement model	3
1.1.2. EU involvement with private enforcement at national level	9
1.1.3. EU legislative action	11
1.2. The vigilance of individuals: aim and content of the study	18
1.2.1. Main research question and relevance	18
1.2.2. Selection, approach and methodology	20
1.2.3. Definitions and editorial remarks	23
1.2.4. Outline of the study	26
2. KEY PRINCIPLES, PUBLIC ENFORCEMENT AND CASE LAW	29
2.1. Principle of national procedural autonomy	29
2.1.1. National procedural autonomy: introduction	29
2.1.2. National procedural autonomy: further remarks	33
2.1.3. Summary	36
2.2. Principles of equivalence and effectiveness	36
2.2.1. Principle of equivalence	37
2.2.2. Principle of effectiveness	38
2.2.3. Summary	43
2.3. Principle of effective judicial protection	44
2.3.1. Effective judicial protection: introduction	44
2.3.2. Effective judicial protection: application	48
2.3.3. Summary	51
2.4. Public enforcement	52
2.4.1. Infringement proceedings	52
2.4.2. Other forms of public enforcement	54
2.4.3. The interaction between public and private enforcement	57
2.4.4. Summary	59
2.5. Key case law relating to private enforcement	60
2.5.1. Simmenthal, Factortame and Francovich	60
2.5.2. Courage and Muñoz	64

2.5.3.	Comparison and assessment	66
2.5.4.	Summary	70
B.	SELECTED EU LEGISLATION	71
3.	PUBLIC PROCUREMENT LAW	73
3.1.	Introduction	73
3.1.1.	Background and substantive law	73
3.1.2.	Procurement Remedies Directives: proposals, adoption and objective	76
3.1.3.	Revisions	78
3.1.4.	Additional general remarks	81
3.2.	Remedies	84
3.2.1.	Interim measures and setting aside injunctions	84
3.2.2.	Actions for damages	86
3.2.3.	Contractual remedy	93
3.3.	Procedural provisions and related issues	98
3.3.1.	Scope and legal standing	98
3.3.2.	Limitation periods and standstill periods	101
3.3.3.	Forum, procedure and general rules	104
3.4.	Other enforcement issues	107
3.4.1.	Alternative compliance mechanisms and alternative dispute resolution	108
3.4.2.	Public enforcement	109
3.5.	Summary	114
4.	INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY LAW	115
4.1.	Introduction	115
4.1.1.	Substantive law and infringements	115
4.1.2.	Proposal, adoption, objective and possible revision	118
4.1.3.	Additional general remarks	121
4.2.	Remedies	126
4.2.1.	Disclosure measures	127
4.2.2.	Interlocutory injunctions and seizures	132
4.2.3.	Corrective measures and 'permanent' injunctions	136
4.2.4.	Actions for damages	140
4.2.5.	Legal costs and publicity measures	145
4.3.	Procedural provisions and related issues	147
4.3.1.	Scope and legal standing	147
4.3.2.	Forum, procedure and general rules	150
4.4.	Other enforcement issues	151
4.4.1.	Alternative dispute resolution	152
4.4.2.	Public enforcement	152
4.5.	Summary	155

5.	CONSUMER PROTECTION LAW	157
5.1.	Introduction	157
5.1.1.	Background	158
5.1.2.	Substantive EU consumer law and consumers' rights of redress	159
5.2.	Consumer Injunctions Directive: injunctions	162
5.2.1.	Introduction, mutual recognition and remedies	162
5.2.2.	Other provisions, practical effects and other legislation	166
5.2.3.	Summary	172
5.3.	Unfair Terms Directive: contractual remedies	172
5.3.1.	Introduction and contractual remedy	172
5.3.2.	Own motion judicial review, practical effects and other legislation	177
5.3.3.	Summary	181
5.4.	Product Liability Directive: damages	182
5.4.1.	Introduction, no-fault liability and damage	182
5.4.2.	Limits, practical effects and other legislation	186
5.4.3.	Summary	191
5.5.	Other enforcement issues	191
5.5.1.	Collective redress	192
5.5.2.	Alternative dispute resolution	198
5.5.3.	Public enforcement	200
5.5.4.	Summary	204
6.	COMPETITION LAW	205
6.1.	Introduction	205
6.1.1.	Substantive EU competition law and its application	206
6.1.2.	Infringements and damage	210
6.1.3.	Article 101(2) TFEU: contractual remedy	212
6.2.	Towards the Competition Damages Directive	213
6.2.1.	Early developments (1960-2000)	214
6.2.2.	Legislative reform and Courage case law (2000-2005)	216
6.2.3.	Green paper, white paper and draft proposal (2005-2010)	221
6.2.4.	Pfleiderer case law and proposal (2010-2013)	227
6.3.	Competition Damages Directive	232
6.3.1.	Adoption, objectives, scope and legal basis	232
6.3.2.	Actions for damages, qualification and quantification	238
6.3.3.	Disclosure measures	242
6.3.4.	Joint and several liability and passing-on	248
6.3.5.	Procedural provisions and related issues	251
6.4.	Other enforcement issues	256
6.4.1.	Alternative dispute resolution and settlements	256

6.4.2. Public enforcement	257
6.5. Summary	262
C. COMPARISON AND CONTEXTUALISATION: REMEDIES AND PROCEDURES	265
7. ACTIONS FOR DAMAGES AND ACTIONS FOR INJUNCTIONS	267
7.1. Actions for damages	267
7.1.1. General: contradictions and paradoxes	268
7.1.2. Fault	275
7.1.3. Causality	282
7.1.4. Quantification of damages	287
7.1.5. Qualification of damages and joint and several liability	290
7.1.6. Punitive damages and other damages going beyond compensation	294
7.1.7. Summary	299
7.2. Actions for injunctions	301
7.2.1. Comparative overview and general remarks	301
7.2.2. Injunctions: practice and applicable conditions	306
7.2.3. Competition law and cross-border litigation	310
7.2.4. Summary	315
8. CONTRACTUAL AND OTHER REMEDIES	317
8.1. Contractual remedies	317
8.1.1. Terminology, nature and functioning in practice	317
8.1.2. Member States' flexibility and non-infringing provisions	324
8.1.3. Excluded contracts	328
8.1.4. Summary	334
8.2. Other remedies	336
8.2.1. Interim relief	336
8.2.2. Disclosure measures	343
8.2.3. Recurring penalty payments	348
8.2.4. Publicity measures	351
8.2.5. Measures on legal costs	354
8.2.6. 'Unregulated' remedies: declarations, unjust enrichment, restitution	360
9. PROCEDURAL PROVISIONS AND OTHER ISSUES	367
9.1. Scope, legal standing, limitation periods and rules of evidence	367
9.1.1. Scope	367
9.1.2. Legal standing	372
9.1.3. Limitation periods	377
9.1.4. Rules of evidence	382

9.2.	Forum, settlements, judicial review and general rules	387
9.2.1.	Forum	387
9.2.2.	Rules facilitating settlements	391
9.2.3.	Standard of judicial review	396
9.2.4.	Own motion judicial review	399
9.2.5.	General rules	404
D.	BROADER ASPECTS, PERSPECTIVES AND CONCLUSIONS	407
10.	THE HOW, WHEN AND WHY OF EU PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT	
	LEGISLATION	409
10.1.	The EU's legal scope to act	409
10.1.1.	Legal basis issues	410
10.1.2.	Subsidiarity, proportionality and fundamental rights	416
10.1.3.	National procedural autonomy revisited	419
10.1.4.	Summary	425
10.2.	Political aspects and policy-related factors	426
10.2.1.	Political aspects	426
10.2.2.	Overall enforcement framework	430
10.2.3.	International dimension	432
10.2.4.	Temporal aspect	434
10.2.5.	Summary	438
10.3.	The added-value of EU legislation on private enforcement	439
10.3.1.	Legislative vs. judicial action	439
10.3.2.	Added-value: other relevant factors	445
10.3.3.	Summary	449
10.4.	Coherence and fragmentation	449
10.4.1.	Coherence and fragmentation at EU level	450
10.4.2.	Coherence and fragmentation at national level	455
10.4.3.	Towards a more coherent approach?	459
10.4.4.	Summary	465
11.	TWO PERSPECTIVES ON PRIVATE ENFORCEMENT	467
11.1.	The effectiveness perspective	467
11.1.1.	Two expressions of effectiveness	467
11.1.2.	From dual nature to dual vigilance	471
11.1.3.	Tensions and potential conflicts	476
11.1.4.	Three final remarks	482
11.1.5.	Summary	487
11.2.	The horizontalisation perspective	487
11.2.1.	The horizontalisation of EU law and its enforcement	488
11.2.2.	Private enforcement implications	494
11.2.3.	Costs, litigation culture and diffuse interests	499
11.2.4.	Hybrid enforcement	504

11.2.5. Fundamental rights (1): horizontal effects and 'civil' rights	509
11.2.6. Fundamental rights (2): 'criminal' rights	513
11.2.7. Summary	518
12. SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	519
12.1. Private enforcement between interference and autonomy	519
12.1.1. The scope for enacting EU legislation on private enforcement	520
12.1.2. The limits to the EU's scope to act and its consequences	522
12.2. Remedies and procedures for private enforcement purposes	526
12.2.1. Actions for damages	527
12.2.2. Actions for injunctions	531
12.2.3. Contractual remedies	534
12.2.4. Interim relief, disclosure measures and penalty payments	537
12.2.5. Publicity measures, legal costs and 'unregulated' remedies	542
12.2.6. Legal standing, limitation periods and rules of evidence	546
12.2.7. Forum, rules facilitating settlements and judicial review	549
12.3. Public and private perspectives on private enforcement	553
12.3.1. Private enforcement as a complementary enforcement instrument	553
12.3.2. Four inherent limitations and points of attention	561
12.3.3. Towards an EU policy on private enforcement?	566
SUMMARY (ABSTRACT) & SAMENVATTING	573
LEGISLATION & OFFICIAL DOCUMENTS	575
CASE LAW & OPINIONS	593
BIBLIOGRAPHY	603
ABBREVIATIONS	635
INDEX	637
CURRICULUM VITAE	641